From: Neil Ticktin
To: Lin, Cindy
Subject: Re: Response to Comments: Malibu Creek and Lagoon TMDL
Date: Monday, July 08, 2013 12:52:29 PM

Thanks for confirming that the hundreds were not included -- as the 50 or so other letters were. In other words, that you editorially removed 75% of the responses.

It's not your place to edit or combine people's comments to you. Just because they all agree doesn't minimize the fact that they have communicated to you individually, or what they feel.

You've once again violated basic rules of transparency. If you want to right this wrong, then do so now -- and then communicate to the public why people were omitted and announce the resolution to your ommission.

Shame on the EPA for minimizing the response in this way.

On Jul 8, 2013, at 11:34 AM, "Lin, Cindy" <Lin.Cindy@epa.gov> wrote:

> Hi Neil,
>
> The comments received from the letters are included in our Response to Comment Document in italics.
>
> We reviewed all the letters received after the public comment period closed in January 28, 2013. We looked at all the letters and identified the individual, unique comments. We then copied the unique comments word for word into a general comment letter, where we provided a response. Please see the attached letter I sent earlier (comments in italics are taken from the comment letters). Many of these letters contained the same comment so we included the comment and our response in one document for the reader's convenience.
>
> Respectfully,
>
> Cindy Lin
>
> ---
>
> **From:** Neil Ticktin [mailto:neil@ticktin.com]
> **Sent:** Monday, July 08, 2013 11:07 AM
> **To:** Lin, Cindy
> **Subject:** Re: Response to Comments: Malibu Creek and Lagoon TMDL
>
> Cindy,
>
> Is there a reason that 75% of the public comments are not included in your web page? I know of HUNDREDS of emails that were sent to the EPA in response --

and not one was included as far as I can tell (if so, show me where please).

Neil

On Jul 8, 2013, at 11:00 AM, "Lin, Cindy" <Lin.Cindy@epa.gov> wrote:

Hello,

We are providing a response to your comment letter submitted to USEPA Region 9 in May 2013, regarding USEPA establishing TMDLs for Malibu Creek and Lagoon for sedimentation and nutrients impacting benthic community. USEPA established TMDLs for Malibu Creek and Lagoon on July 2, 2013.

Please see the attached document for our response to your comments.

Below is the link to USEPA R9's website for the Final TMDL and related documents.
http://www.epa.gov/region9/water/tmdl/progress.html

Thank you for your interest and concern.

Respectfully,

Cindy Lin

Dr. Cindy Lin, D.ENV.
US EPA Region IX
Southern California Office
600 Wilshire Blvd Suite 1460
213-244-1803 Phone
213-244-1805 FAX

<Final USEPA_Malibu RTC_for_post_comment_period_07 02 2013.pdf>