From: Dunkins, Robin
Location: Conference Call
Importance: Normal
Subject: FW: OIG Meeting with OAQPS Staff
Start Date/Time: Wed 6/29/2016 6:30:00 PM
End Date/Time: Wed 6/29/2016 8:00:00 PM
OAQPS Petition Questions_FINAL.docx

-----Original Appointment-----
From: Narimatsu, Julie
Sent: Thursday, June 16, 2016 5:09 PM
To: Narimatsu, Julie; Dunkins, Robin; Schrock, Bill; Harnett, Bill; Hauck, Erica; Good, Kevin; Jones, Richard
Cc: Vetter, Cheryl; Nizich, Greg; Gmyr, Joanna
Subject: OIG Meeting with OAQPS Staff
When: Wednesday, June 29, 2016 1:30 PM-3:00 PM (UTC-06:00) Central Time (US & Canada).
Where: Conference Call

Please use the following conference call information:

Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy

A question list will be provided closer to the meeting date.

Thanks,
Julie

To: Schrock, Bill[Schrock.Bill@epa.gov]
From: Dunkins, Robin
Sent: Tue 6/28/2016 8:09:21 PM
Subject: RE: CAFO IG Question #10

thanks

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

dunkins.robin@epa.gov

From: Schrock, Bill
Sent: Tuesday, June 28, 2016 4:07 PM
To: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>
Subject: CAFO IG Question #10

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Approach

In response to the assigned task, OAR, ORD and OECA staff met several times to discuss how best to address the identified needs. Staff identified the following approach:

1. Develop and promote the use of BMPs.

•□□□□□□□□ OAR will work with ORD (and USDA) colleagues to investigate and develop BMPs (and control techniques) to reduce AFO emissions. This research will be used to address air resource concerns in areas where AFO emissions are determined to significantly contribute to air quality impairment, and potentially to satisfy state implementation plan requirements. EPA will also use the results to respond to current AFO-related petitions filed under Clean Air Act sections 111 and 108/109.

Bill Schrock
U.S. EPA
RTP, NC 27709
(919) 541-5032
(919) 541-3470 (fax)

To: Narimatsu, Julie[Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov]
From: Dunkins, Robin
Sent: Thur 6/2/2016 11:40:20 PM
Subject: Re: OIG Evaluation: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Robin Dunkins, Leader
Natural Resources Group
OAR/OAQPS/SPPD
RTP, NC 27711
Office: 919-541-5335
Cell: 919-605-1178
dunkins.robin@epa.gov

On Jun 2, 2016, at 5:08 PM, Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov> wrote:

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

1. We have identified three petitions to EPA to regulate AFO air emissions:

1) Sierra Club et al (2009) – petition to list hydrogen sulfide as a regulated HAP

2) Humane Society et al (2009) – petition to list CAFOs as source of pollution and set performance standards for new and existing facilities

3) Environmental Integrity Project et al (2011) – petition to list ammonia as a criteria air pollutant and set new NAAQS

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Julie

From: Dunkins, Robin
Sent: Thursday, June 02, 2016 4:01 PM
To: Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>; Keating, Martha <keating.martha@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamason, Bill <Lamason.Bill@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: OIG Evaluation: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations

Hey Julie, I gave you contact names for the other petitions. Is there a new one that has come up?

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

dunkins.robin@epa.gov

From: Narimatsu, Julie
Sent: Thursday, June 02, 2016 4:49 PM
To: Keating, Martha <keating.martha@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Lamason, Bill <Lamason.Bill@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: OIG Evaluation: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations

Thank you Martha. We have already contacted Bill, and I believe he is working on contacts

for the other petitions.

Thanks,

Julie

From: Keating, Martha
Sent: Thursday, June 02, 2016 3:32 PM
To: Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Lamason, Bill <Lamason.Bill@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: OIG Evaluation: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations

Hi Julie –

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

I believe that Robin Dunkins provided the correct contact for these petitions – that would be Bill Lamason who is cc'd here.

Thank you,

Martha Keating

Martha Keating|Policy Advisor, Health and Environmental Impacts Division|U.S. EPA, RTP, NC, 27711|(919) 541-9407

From: Narimatsu, Julie
Sent: Thursday, June 02, 2016 10:44 AM
To: Keating, Martha <keating.martha@epa.gov>
Subject: OIG Evaluation: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations

Greetings,

As you may already know, the OIG is conducting an evaluation of EPA's efforts to evaluate air emission from animal feeding operations (see link to the Notification Memo below). We would like to set up an individual discussion with you to discuss EPA's handling of several petitions from environmental groups related to regulating CAFOs under different Clean Air Act provisions. It appears that Wednesday, June 8th at 3pm EDT might work for everyone. If this works for you, I can send out a calendar invite.

https://www.epa.gov/sites/production/files/2016-04/documents/newstarts_03-8-16_airemissions.pdf

Thank you,

Julie Narimatsu

Julie Narimatsu, J.D., MAIR
USEPA Office of Inspector General
Office of Program Evaluation: Air & Research
77 W. Jackson Blvd.
Room 13081/MC IA-13J
Chicago, IL 60604-3507

Tel: (312) 353-4353|| Fax: (312) 353-4225 || Email: narimatsu.julie@epa.gov

Follow-Up OIG Meeting with OAQPS

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

To: Beasley, Lynn[Beasley.Lynn@epa.gov]
From: Thornton, Kecia
Sent: Fri 3/18/2016 3:58:33 PM
Subject: FW: new OIG audit, EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

.....
,,,,,,,,
Hello Lynn!

Please see note below and let me know if these revised dates work for you. Thank you!

Kecia Thornton
(202) 566-1913

From: Hingeley, Maureen
Sent: 3/18/2016 8:01 AM
To: Spriggs, Gwendolyn; Thornton, Kecia; Cuscino, Glen; Ramos, Marilyn; Nolan, Eleanor; Tate, Ragan
Cc: Jones, Mike; Grzegozewski, Nicholas
Subject: RE: new OIG audit, EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Good morning all,

An update to the potential dates/times to meet for a kick-off meeting with the OIG – the following is an updated list of possible dates/times for mid-April:

4/11: 10-12 and 1-3

4/13: 10-12

4/14: 1-2

Due to schedule conflicts amongst our subject matter experts, the weeks of 3/21 and 3/28 will no longer work for OAR.

Sorry for any inconvenience.

Thanks.

From: Hingeley, Maureen
Sent: Thursday, March 17, 2016 8:44 AM
To: Spriggs, Gwendolyn ; Thornton, Kecia ; Starrs, Charles ; Cursio, Heather ; Ramos, Marilyn ; Nolan, Eleanor ; McDermott, Marna
Cc: Jones, Mike ; Grzegozewski, Nicholas
Subject: new OIG audit, EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Good morning all,

For the new OIG audit titled, *EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations,* OAR's subject matter experts have identified the following list of subject matter experts from OAR/OAQPS, OECA, OGC, OLEM, ORD/SAB and OW. We are still in the early stages of finding dates/times of availability (weeks of 3/21 and 3/28) for the entrance meeting. Please let me know if it makes sense for your office to participate in the entrance meeting, and if so, preferable dates/times to meet w/ the OIG. Please let me know if there are any questions or additional info is needed. Thanks.

Bill Schrock – OAR/OAQPS – Point of Contact

Robin Dunkins - OAR/OAQPS

Randy Waite – OAR/OAQPS

Bill Harnett – OAR/OAQPS

Tim Sullivan – OECA

Sanda Howland – OECA

Ed Hanlon – SAB office

Lynn Beasley – OLEM

Sheila Igo – OGC

Scott Jordan – OGC

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

Best,

Maureen

Maureen Hingeley

Office of Program Management Operations

Office of Air and Radiation

EPA

202-564-1306

I've taken a look at the notification memo regarding the NAEMS project and have the following comments/information to offer at this time. First, you requested I identify the subject matter expert in my group that will participate as well as other key staff outside of the my group that are involved in the subject matter. That list has the potential to be long so I will provide a short list with the understanding that we will expand as needed once we have a better understanding of the information and specific questions being asked. As I mentioned earlier, the project lead for the NAEMS retired last year so we may have to piece together some information and we should be able to access files and emails if needed. That said, Bill Schrock who has participated (on and off) in the NAEMS project over the last 10+ years and is familiar with the various CAFO petitions will serve as point of contact on this effort. The initial list of key staff involved in this topic are as follows:

Bill Schrock – OAR/OAQPS – Point of Contact

Robin Dunkins - OAR/OAQPS

Randy Waite – OAR/OAQPS

Bill Harnett – OAR/OAQPS

Tim Sullivan – OECA

Sanda Howland – OECA

Ed Hanlon – SAB office

Lynn Beasley – OLEM

Sheila Igo – OGC

Scott Jordan – OGC

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Let me know if you need anything else from me.

Thanks,

Robin

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

dunkins.robin@epa.gov

From: Hingeley, Maureen
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 1:17 PM
To: McCabe, Janet <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>; Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Page, Steve <Page.Steve@epa.gov>; Koerber, Mike <Koerber.Mike@epa.gov>; OAQPS CMT <OAQPS_CMT@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>; Salgado, Omayra <Salgado.Omayra@epa.gov>; Hyde, Courtney <Hyde.Courtney@epa.gov>; Dunham, Sarah <Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov>; Bullard, Pamela <Bullard.Pamela@epa.gov>; Price, Doris <Price.Doris@epa.gov>
Subject: new OIG audit, EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Hi all,

The OIG has announced a new audit titled, *EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations*. The audit objective is to determine what actions EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The OIG will review applicable laws, regulations, policies, procedures, guidance, and any EPA and non-EPA related modeling or measurement studies related to animal feeding operations' air emissions. In addition to OAR folks, the OIG plans to interview state agencies, industry groups, environmental groups, and stakeholders concerned with this topic. Please share the notification memo with others as appropriate.

Please review the attached audit notification memo, and when available, send me the names of subject matter experts who will be participating in the audit. Please note the notification memo contains a data request. Please let me know if there are any questions or additional info is needed. Thanks.

Best,

Maureen

Maureen Hingeley

Office of Program Management Operations

Office of Air and Radiation

EPA

202-564-1306

From: Hatfield, James
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 12:51 PM
To: McCabe, Janet <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>
Cc: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Page, Steve <Page.Steve@epa.gov>; Hingeley, Maureen <Hingeley.Maureen@epa.gov>; Grzegozewski, Nicholas <Grzegozewski.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Harrison, Melissa <Harrison.Melissa@epa.gov>; Elkins, Arthur <Elkins.Arthur@epa.gov>; Sheehan, Charles <Sheehan.Charles@epa.gov>; Nunez-Mattocks, Aracely <Nunez-Mattocks.Aracely@epa.gov>; Larsen, Alan <Larsen.Alan@epa.gov>; Copper, Carolyn <Copper.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Christensen, Kevin <Christensen.Kevin@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Patrick F. <Sullivan.Patrick@epa.gov>; El-Zoghbi, Christine <El-Zoghbi.Christine@epa.gov>; Lagda, Jeffrey <Lagda.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Hauck, Erica <Hauck.Erica@epa.gov>; Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>; Good, Kevin <Good.Kevin@epa.gov>; Woodard, Tempestt <Woodard.Tempestt@epa.gov>; Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

The attached memorandum is to inform you that the EPA Office of Inspector General (OIG) plans to begin a review of EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018. This project is included in our OIG Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan. Our objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The attached memorandum also identifies information that we are requesting be provided to us, either prior to or during our kickoff meeting.

We will contact your audit liaison in the near future to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the assignment objective and our planned work. If you or your staff have any questions, please contact me at (919) 541-1030, or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629.

Jim

James L. Hatfield

Director, Air Product Line

USEPA Office of Inspector General

Office of Program Evaluation

109 TW Alexander Dr., N-283-01

Research Triangle Park NC 27711

919-541-1030

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
INSPECTOR GENERAL

March 08, 2016

MEMORANDUM

SUBJECT: Project Notification:
EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations
Project No. OPE-FY16-0018

FROM: James L. Hatfield, Director, Air Evaluations
Office of Program Evaluation

TO: Janet McCabe, Acting Assistant Administrator
Office of Air and Radiation

The purpose of this memorandum is to notify you that the Office of Inspector General (OIG) for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) plans to begin an evaluation of the EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations. This project is included in the OIG's Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan.

The OIG's objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study.

During the preliminary research phase of our evaluation, we plan to review applicable laws, regulations, policies, procedures and guidance related to animal feeding operations' air emissions. We also plan to review any EPA animal feeding operations' air emissions modeling or measurement studies as well as any animal feeding operations' air emissions studies conducted by entities outside of the agency.

We plan to begin our work within Office of Air and Radiation's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards. We may also meet with selected state agencies that regulate animal feeding operations' air emissions, and with industry groups, environmental groups, and other stakeholders concerned with animal feeding operations' air emissions and how they are evaluated and addressed by the EPA.

We will contact your audit liaison to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the project's objective and our planned work. We will also answer any questions about the evaluation process and reporting procedures. Prior to or during our kickoff meeting, we request that you provide us with copies of (or links to) the following materials:

- A comprehensive list of all operating animal feeding operations in the United States that meet the definition of concentrated animal feeding operations, including the type, size, and geographic location of each facility.

- The EPA's response to the Science Advisory Board's 2013 review of the National Air Emissions Monitoring Study reports.
- The EPA's responses to all citizen petitions regarding potential regulation of animal feeding operations' air emissions.

To ensure the success and timely completion of this project, we respectfully note that the OIG is authorized by the Inspector General Act of 1978 to have timely access to personnel and all material necessary to complete its objectives. For this evaluation, we may request access to EPA databases, meetings and interviews with EPA personnel and contractors, and documentation related to animal feeding operations in the United States. We will request your resolution if an agency employee or contractor refuses to provide requested records to the OIG, or otherwise fails to cooperate with the OIG. We may report unresolved access matters to the Administrator and include the incident in the Semiannual Report to Congress.

If you or your staff have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (919) 541-1030 or hatfield.jim@epa.gov; or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629 or hauck.erica@epa.gov.

cc: Elizabeth Shaw, Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Air and Radiation
Steve Page, Director, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Office of Air and Radiation
Maureen Hingeley, Audit Follow-Up Coordinator, Office of Air and Radiation
Nic Grzegozewski, Agency Follow-Up Coordinator
Melissa Harrison, Press Secretary, Office of Public Affairs
Arthur A. Elkins Jr., Inspector General
Charles Sheehan, Deputy Inspector General
Aracely Nunez-Mattocks, Chief of Staff, OIG
Alan Larsen, Counsel to the Inspector General
Carolyn Copper, Assistant Inspector General for Program Evaluation
Kevin Christensen, Assistant Inspector General for Audit
Patrick Sullivan, Assistant Inspector General for Investigations
Christine El-Zoghbi, Deputy Assistant Inspector General for Program Evaluation
Jennifer Kaplan, Deputy Assistant Inspector General for Congressional and Public Affairs
Jeffrey Lagda, Congressional and Media Liaison, OIG
Erica Hauck, Project Manager, Air Evaluations, OIG
Richard Jones, Air Evaluations, OIG
Kevin Good, Air Evaluations, OIG
Tempestt Woodard, Air Evaluations, OIG
Julie Narimatsu, Air Evaluations, OIG

To: Kabler, Lauren[Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov]
Cc: Howland, Sanda[Howland.Sanda@epa.gov]; Greenwald, Kathryn[Greenwald.Kathryn@epa.gov]
From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Thur 3/17/2016 4:24:19 PM
Subject: RE: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

I am generally available any days of those weeks, except 03.22 (Tu) and 04.06 (Wed) due to long or a lot of meetings on those days.

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Howland, Sanda
Sent: Thursday, March 17, 2016 11:53 AM
To: Kabler, Lauren <Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov>; Greenwald, Kathryn <Greenwald.Kathryn@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Thanks, Lauren. In re: availability those weeks, I am ***not free*** 3/24, 3/25, or 3/31, or the afternoon of 4/7, otherwise should be able to make it. Sanda

From: Kabler, Lauren

Sent: Thursday, March 17, 2016 11:13 AM
To: Greenwald, Kathryn <Greenwald.Kathryn@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>; Howland, Sanda <Howland.Sanda@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

FYI

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

> **From:** "Kabler, Lauren" <Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov>
> **Date:** March 17, 2016 at 11:07:07 AM EDT
> **To:** "OKeefe, Susan" <OKeefe.Susan@epa.gov>, "Makepeace, Caroline" <Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov>, "Brooks, Phillip" <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>, "Chapman, Apple" <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>, "Pollins, Mark" <Pollins.Mark@epa.gov>, "Theis, Joseph" <Theis.Joseph@epa.gov>, "Bahk, Benjamin" <Bahk.Benjamin@epa.gov>
> **Subject: Fwd: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018**
>
> Please let me know who should attend from your office, what dates below work best and which Division within OCE will take the lead on this?
>
> Thx!
>
> Sent from my iPhone
>
> Begin forwarded message:
>
> > **From:** "Spriggs, Gwendolyn" <Spriggs.Gwendolyn@epa.gov>
> > **Date:** March 17, 2016 at 8:33:33 AM EDT
> > **To:** "Kabler, Lauren" <Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov>
> > **Subject: RE: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018**
> >
> > Hey there,

I can't recall our last exchange on this one…but, we will be included on the entrance conference. OAR is beginning to plan for the entrance. The staff in OAR shared two OECA names with their AFC (Tim Sullivan and Sanda Howland).

Pls share times of availability for the weeks of (3/21), (3/28) and (4/4). It looks like there will be multiple AAships involved, so we'll do our best with finding a time that works for all. Pls respond as soon as you can with your staff availability.

Thanks, GJS

From: Kabler, Lauren
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 12:43 PM
To: Spriggs, Gwendolyn <Spriggs.Gwendolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Here it is!

Lauren V. Kabler

Special Counsel

Office of Civil Enforcement

U.S. EPA

Phone: 202.564.4052

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 12:13 PM
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Spence, Kelley
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:30 AM
To: Benedict, Kristen <Benedict.Kristen@epa.gov>; Bash, Jesse <Bash.Jesse@epa.gov>; Walker, JohnT <Walker.Johnt@epa.gov>; Shores, Richard <Shores.Richard@epa.gov>; Nunez, Carlos <Nunez.Carlos@epa.gov>; Jordan, Scott <Jordan.Scott@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>; McKinney, Doug <Mckinney.Douglas@epa.gov>; Thoma, Eben <Thoma.Eben@epa.gov>; Yelverton, William <Yelverton.William@epa.gov>; Vette, Alan <Vette.Alan@epa.gov>; Merrill, Raymond <Merrill.Raymond@epa.gov>; Thompson, Rhonda <Thompson.Rhonda@epa.gov>; Scheffe, Rich <Scheffe.Rich@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

FYI

We'll have a meeting to discuss this soon.

Kelley Spence, PhD. | Environmental Engineer | Natural Resources Group – Mail Code E143-03 | Sector Policies and Programs Division | Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency | Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 | Phone: 919-541-3158 | Fax: 919-541-3470 |

From: Dunkins, Robin
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 10:56 AM
To: Spence, Kelley <Spence.Kelley@epa.gov>; Bradfield, John <Bradfield.John@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Costa, Allison <Costa.Allison@epa.gov>
Cc: Schrock, Bill <Schrock.Bill@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

FYI.

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

dunkins.robin@epa.gov

From: Koerber, Mike
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 4:44 PM

To: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Harnett, Bill <Harnett.Bill@epa.gov>; Schrock, Bill <Schrock.Bill@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

In case you haven't heard…..

From: Hatfield, James
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 12:51 PM
To: McCabe, Janet <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>
Cc: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Page, Steve <Page.Steve@epa.gov>; Hingeley, Maureen <Hingeley.Maureen@epa.gov>; Grzegozewski, Nicholas <Grzegozewski.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Harrison, Melissa <Harrison.Melissa@epa.gov>; Elkins, Arthur <Elkins.Arthur@epa.gov>; Sheehan, Charles <Sheehan.Charles@epa.gov>; Nunez-Mattocks, Aracely <Nunez-Mattocks.Aracely@epa.gov>; Larsen, Alan <Larsen.Alan@epa.gov>; Copper, Carolyn <Copper.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Christensen, Kevin <Christensen.Kevin@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Patrick F. <Sullivan.Patrick@epa.gov>; El-Zoghbi, Christine <El-Zoghbi.Christine@epa.gov>; Lagda, Jeffrey <Lagda.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Hauck, Erica <Hauck.Erica@epa.gov>; Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>; Good, Kevin <Good.Kevin@epa.gov>; Woodard, Tempestt <Woodard.Tempestt@epa.gov>; Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

The attached memorandum is to inform you that the EPA Office of Inspector General (OIG) plans to begin a review of EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018. This project is included in our OIG Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan. Our objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The attached memorandum also identifies information that we are requesting be provided to us, either prior to or during our kickoff meeting.

We will contact your audit liaison in the near future to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the assignment objective and our planned work. If you or your staff have any questions, please contact me at (919) 541-1030, or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629.

Jim

James L. Hatfield

Director, Air Product Line

USEPA Office of Inspector General

Office of Program Evaluation

109 TW Alexander Dr., N-283-01

Research Triangle Park NC 27711

919-541-1030

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20460

OFFICE OF
INSPECTOR GENERAL

March 08, 2016

MEMORANDUM

SUBJECT: Project Notification:
EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations
Project No. OPE-FY16-0018

FROM: James L. Hatfield, Director, Air Evaluations
Office of Program Evaluation

TO: Janet McCabe, Acting Assistant Administrator
Office of Air and Radiation

The purpose of this memorandum is to notify you that the Office of Inspector General (OIG) for the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) plans to begin an evaluation of the EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations. This project is included in the OIG's Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan.

The OIG's objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study.

During the preliminary research phase of our evaluation, we plan to review applicable laws, regulations, policies, procedures and guidance related to animal feeding operations' air emissions. We also plan to review any EPA animal feeding operations' air emissions modeling or measurement studies as well as any animal feeding operations' air emissions studies conducted by entities outside of the agency.

We plan to begin our work within Office of Air and Radiation's Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards. We may also meet with selected state agencies that regulate animal feeding operations' air emissions, and with industry groups, environmental groups, and other stakeholders concerned with animal feeding operations' air emissions and how they are evaluated and addressed by the EPA.

We will contact your audit liaison to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the project's objective and our planned work. We will also answer any questions about the evaluation process and reporting procedures. Prior to or during our kickoff meeting, we request that you provide us with copies of (or links to) the following materials:

- A comprehensive list of all operating animal feeding operations in the United States that meet the definition of concentrated animal feeding operations, including the type, size, and geographic location of each facility.

- The EPA's response to the Science Advisory Board's 2013 review of the National Air Emissions Monitoring Study reports.
- The EPA's responses to all citizen petitions regarding potential regulation of animal feeding operations' air emissions.

To ensure the success and timely completion of this project, we respectfully note that the OIG is authorized by the Inspector General Act of 1978 to have timely access to personnel and all material necessary to complete its objectives. For this evaluation, we may request access to EPA databases, meetings and interviews with EPA personnel and contractors, and documentation related to animal feeding operations in the United States. We will request your resolution if an agency employee or contractor refuses to provide requested records to the OIG, or otherwise fails to cooperate with the OIG. We may report unresolved access matters to the Administrator and include the incident in the Semiannual Report to Congress.

If you or your staff have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (919) 541-1030 or hatfield.jim@epa.gov; or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629 or hauck.erica@epa.gov.

cc: Elizabeth Shaw, Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Air and Radiation
Steve Page, Director, Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards, Office of Air and Radiation
Maureen Hingeley, Audit Follow-Up Coordinator, Office of Air and Radiation
Nic Grzegozewski, Agency Follow-Up Coordinator
Melissa Harrison, Press Secretary, Office of Public Affairs
Arthur A. Elkins Jr., Inspector General
Charles Sheehan, Deputy Inspector General
Aracely Nunez-Mattocks, Chief of Staff, OIG
Alan Larsen, Counsel to the Inspector General
Carolyn Copper, Assistant Inspector General for Program Evaluation
Kevin Christensen, Assistant Inspector General for Audit
Patrick Sullivan, Assistant Inspector General for Investigations
Christine El-Zoghbi, Deputy Assistant Inspector General for Program Evaluation
Jennifer Kaplan, Deputy Assistant Inspector General for Congressional and Public Affairs
Jeffrey Lagda, Congressional and Media Liaison, OIG
Erica Hauck, Project Manager, Air Evaluations, OIG
Richard Jones, Air Evaluations, OIG
Kevin Good, Air Evaluations, OIG
Tempestt Woodard, Air Evaluations, OIG
Julie Narimatsu, Air Evaluations, OIG

KICKOFF MEETING AGENDA

OIG Evaluation of EPA Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions from Animal Feeding Operations
April 11, 2016

I. Evaluation Objective:

To determine what actions EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from Animal Feeding Operations (AFOs), including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study (NAEMS).

II. OIG Planned Scope and Methodology:

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

III. OIG Evaluation Process.

IV. Agency Questions Regarding OIG Evaluation

V. Establish Agency Contact(s) for the Following Topic Areas:

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

VI. Initial Questions for Discussion at Kickoff Conference:

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

VII. Additional Information Requested (please provide requested information in electronic format if possible):

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

(b) (5), Deliberative Process

[redacted]

VIII. Next Steps:

Establish how often the OIG team will communicate with OAR/OECA managers to provide updates on the evaluation.

To: Koerber, Mike[Koerber.Mike@epa.gov]
From: South, Peter
Sent: Tue 3/8/2016 8:07:56 PM
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018
OIG Project Notification_ Project No OPE_FY16_0018.pdf

FYI

From: Hatfield, James
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 12:51 PM
To: McCabe, Janet <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>
Cc: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Page, Steve <Page.Steve@epa.gov>; Hingeley, Maureen <Hingeley.Maureen@epa.gov>; Grzegozewski, Nicholas <Grzegozewski.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Harrison, Melissa <Harrison.Melissa@epa.gov>; Elkins, Arthur <Elkins.Arthur@epa.gov>; Sheehan, Charles <Sheehan.Charles@epa.gov>; Nunez-Mattocks, Aracely <Nunez-Mattocks.Aracely@epa.gov>; Larsen, Alan <Larsen.Alan@epa.gov>; Copper, Carolyn <Copper.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Christensen, Kevin <Christensen.Kevin@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Patrick F. <Sullivan.Patrick@epa.gov>; El-Zoghbi, Christine <El-Zoghbi.Christine@epa.gov>; Lagda, Jeffrey <Lagda.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Hauck, Erica <Hauck.Erica@epa.gov>; Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>; Good, Kevin <Good.Kevin@epa.gov>; Woodard, Tempestt <Woodard.Tempestt@epa.gov>; Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

The attached memorandum is to inform you that the EPA Office of Inspector General (OIG) plans to begin a review of EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018. This project is included in our OIG Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan. Our objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The attached memorandum also identifies information that we are requesting be provided to us, either prior to or during our kickoff meeting.

We will contact your audit liaison in the near future to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the assignment objective and our planned work. If you or your staff have any questions, please contact me at (919) 541-1030, or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629.

Jim

James L. Hatfield

Director, Air Product Line

USEPA Office of Inspector General

Office of Program Evaluation

109 TW Alexander Dr., N-283-01

Research Triangle Park NC 27711

919-541-1030

To: McCabe, Janet[McCabe.Janet@epa.gov]; Shaw, Betsy[Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov]; Stewart, Lori[Stewart.Lori@epa.gov]; Niebling, William[Niebling.William@epa.gov]; Goffman, Joseph[Goffman.Joseph@epa.gov]; DeMocker, Jim[DeMocker.Jim@epa.gov]; Salgado, Omayra[Salgado.Omayra@epa.gov]; Flynn, Mike[Flynn.Mike@epa.gov]; Grundler, Christopher[grundler.christopher@epa.gov]; Page, Steve[Page.Steve@epa.gov]; Dunham, Sarah[Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov]; Cherepy, Andrea[Cherepy.Andrea@epa.gov]; OAQPS CMT[OAQPS_CMT@epa.gov]; Koerber, Mike[Koerber.Mike@epa.gov]; Hyde, Courtney[Hyde.Courtney@epa.gov]; Krieger, Jackie[Krieger.Jackie@epa.gov]; Logan, Kia[Logan.Kia@epa.gov]; Bullard, Pamela[Bullard.Pamela@epa.gov]; Hengst, Benjamin[Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John[Shoaff.John@epa.gov]; Jones, Mike[Jones.Mike@epa.gov]; Collins, JoLynn[Collins.Jolynn@epa.gov]; Price, Doris[Price.Doris@epa.gov]
Cc: Wortman, Eric[Wortman.Eric@epa.gov]
From: Hingeley, Maureen
Sent: Fri 3/11/2016 3:06:13 PM
Subject: RE: OAR monthly audit tracking charts (OIG and GAO) _ March 2016
OAR's IG_GAO_audits_March 2016.xlsx

Good morning all,

Attached are the monthly audit tracking charts for OAR's active OIG and GAO audits. There is one new audit for this update. Updates are noted in red text.

Highlights:

o New OIG audit: *EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations,* as identified in the OIG's 2016 annual plan. Audit objective: To determine what actions EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The OIG plans to review applicable laws, regulations, policies, procedures, guidance, and any EPA and non-EPA related modeling or measurement studies related to animal feeding operations' air emissions.

▪ A kick-off meeting with OAQPS' and OECA's technical folks is being organized. The OIG will also be interviewing relevant state agencies, industry groups, environmental groups, and stakeholders concerned with this topic.

Please let me know if there are any questions or additional information is needed. Thanks.

Best,

Maureen

Maureen Hingeley

Office of Program Management Operations

Office of Air and Radiation

US EPA

202-564-1306

To: McCabe, Janet[McCabe.Janet@epa.gov]
Cc: Shaw, Betsy[Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov]; Page, Steve[Page.Steve@epa.gov]; Hingeley, Maureen[Hingeley.Maureen@epa.gov]; Grzegozewski, Nicholas[Grzegozewski.Nicholas@epa.gov]; Harrison, Melissa[Harrison.Melissa@epa.gov]; Elkins, Arthur[Elkins.Arthur@epa.gov]; Sheehan, Charles[Sheehan.Charles@epa.gov]; Nunez-Mattocks, Aracely[Nunez-Mattocks.Aracely@epa.gov]; Larsen, Alan[Larsen.Alan@epa.gov]; Copper, Carolyn[Copper.Carolyn@epa.gov]; Christensen, Kevin[Christensen.Kevin@epa.gov]; Sullivan, Patrick F.[Sullivan.Patrick@epa.gov]; El-Zoghbi, Christine[El-Zoghbi.Christine@epa.gov]; Lagda, Jeffrey[Lagda.Jeffrey@epa.gov]; Hauck, Erica[Hauck.Erica@epa.gov]; Jones, Richard[Jones.Richard@epa.gov]; Good, Kevin[Good.Kevin@epa.gov]; Woodard, Tempestt[Woodard.Tempestt@epa.gov]; Narimatsu, Julie[Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov]; Jones, Mike[Jones.Mike@epa.gov]
From: Hatfield, James
Sent: Tue 3/8/2016 5:50:43 PM
Subject: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018
OIG Project Notification_ Project No OPE_FY16_0018.pdf

The attached memorandum is to inform you that the EPA Office of Inspector General (OIG) plans to begin a review of EPA's efforts to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018. This project is included in our OIG Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan. Our objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The attached memorandum also identifies information that we are requesting be provided to us, either prior to or during our kickoff meeting.

We will contact your audit liaison in the near future to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the assignment objective and our planned work. If you or your staff have any questions, please contact me at (919) 541-1030, or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629.

Jim

James L. Hatfield

Director, Air Product Line

USEPA Office of Inspector General

Office of Program Evaluation

109 TW Alexander Dr., N-283-01

Research Triangle Park NC 27711

919-541-1030

To: Howland, Sanda[Howland.Sanda@epa.gov]; Fergusson, Bruce[Fergusson.Bruce@epa.gov]
From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Tue 7/19/2016 9:00:29 PM
Subject: RE: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Sanda and Bruce:

Are you available for a short call with OIG at 3 pm tomorrow (Wednesday) to discuss the Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process Please advise. I still need to confirm OIG's availability. If that does not work for OIG, do you have any availability Thursday or are we into next week?

Thanks –

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Tuesday, July 12, 2016 3:37 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Ok, will do. Thanks Tim

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Tuesday, July 12, 2016 3:28 PM
To: Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Hi, Rich.

I suggest contacting OAR's Bill Schrock and/or his supervisor, Robin Dunkins, about who from EPA was involved in those technical discussions. I will also check with Sanda about whether anyone here in OECA may have been involved in those initial discussions. Sanda was out of the office last week and is on work travel this week.

Thanks –

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media

whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Wednesday, July 06, 2016 4:22 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Tim,

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Many thanks,

Rich

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Tuesday, July 05, 2016 10:42 AM
To: Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>
Cc: Breedlove, Dan <Breedlove.Dan@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Hi, Richard.

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Wednesday, June 29, 2016 1:49 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Subject: Question regarding Premium Standard Farms

Hi Tim,

I was reviewing the "Fact Sheet" for the PSF enforcement case from 2001. It cites injunctive relief of $50 million (estimated value) and includes the following requirement pertaining to air emissions:

□□□□□□□□□ Monitoring of air emissions of particulate matter, volatile organic compounds,

hydrogen sulfide, and ammonia from representative barns and anaerobic lagoons. The monitoring will be conducted before and after installation of each control technology being tested by the companies. If the monitoring levels exceed CAA thresholds for any regulated pollutant, the companies are required to apply to the State of Missouri for any necessary Clean A ir Act permits.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Many thanks,

Rich Jones

OIG Program Analyst

919-541-5358

To: Jones, Richard[Jones.Richard@epa.gov]
From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Fri 4/22/2016 2:49:34 PM
Subject: RE: Meeting with Office of Inspector General

Rich:

I have time both days. Are you looking to speak with me individually or with the OECA staff team that worked on the Agreement over the years?

Thanks –

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Tuesday, April 19, 2016 9:50 AM

To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Subject: Meeting with Office of Inspector General

Hi Tim,

Do you have an hour on Tuesday (4/26) or Wednesday (4/27) of next week to meet with us to discuss the AFO consent agreement?

Thanks,

Rich Jones

OIG Program Analyst

919-541-5358

To: OKeefe, Susan[OKeefe.Susan@epa.gov]
Cc: Makepeace, Caroline[Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov]
From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Thur 3/17/2016 4:56:44 PM
Subject: RE: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

So you know, Sanda is still interested in participating in the AFO-CAFO and NAEMS meetings, etc.

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: OKeefe, Susan
Sent: Thursday, March 17, 2016 12:54 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Cc: Makepeace, Caroline <Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Bless you! Thanks.

Susan O'Keefe, Associate Director

Special Litigation & Projects Division

Office of Civil Enforcement

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

202-564-4021

okeefe.susan@epa.gov

Sent from my iPhone

On Mar 17, 2016, at 12:39 PM, Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov> wrote:

Susan Shinkman told me the AFO-CAFO was traveling with me and AED management has gone to the most recent meetings with OAR on the NAEMS.

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: OKeefe, Susan
Sent: Thursday, March 17, 2016 12:38 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>; Makepeace, Caroline <Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Susan O'Keefe, Acting Director

Special Litigation & Projects Division

Office of Civil Enforcement

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

202-564-4021

okeefe.susan@epa.gov

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Kabler, Lauren" <Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov>
Date: March 17, 2016 at 11:07:07 AM EDT
To: "OKeefe, Susan" <OKeefe.Susan@epa.gov>, "Makepeace, Caroline" <Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov>, "Brooks, Phillip" <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>, "Chapman, Apple" <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>, "Pollins, Mark" <Pollins.Mark@epa.gov>, "Theis, Joseph" <Theis.Joseph@epa.gov>, "Bahk, Benjamin" <Bahk.Benjamin@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Please let me know who should attend from your office, what dates below work best and which Division within OCE will take the lead on this?

Thx!

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Spriggs, Gwendolyn" <Spriggs.Gwendolyn@epa.gov>
Date: March 17, 2016 at 8:33:33 AM EDT
To: "Kabler, Lauren" <Kabler.Lauren@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

<image001.gif>

Hey there,

I can't recall our last exchange on this one…but, we will be included on the entrance conference. OAR is beginning to plan for the entrance. The staff in OAR shared two OECA names with their AFC (Tim Sullivan and Sanda Howland).

Pls share times of availability for the weeks of (3/21), (3/28) and (4/4). It looks like there will be multiple AAships involved, so we'll do our best with finding a time that works for all. Pls respond as soon as you can with your staff availability.

Thanks, GJS

From: Kabler, Lauren
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 12:43 PM
To: Spriggs, Gwendolyn <Spriggs.Gwendolyn@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Here it is!

Lauren V. Kabler

Special Counsel

Office of Civil Enforcement

U.S. EPA

Phone: 202.564.4052

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 12:13 PM
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Spence, Kelley
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 11:30 AM
To: Benedict, Kristen <Benedict.Kristen@epa.gov>; Bash, Jesse <Bash.Jesse@epa.gov>; Walker, JohnT <Walker.Johnt@epa.gov>; Shores, Richard <Shores.Richard@epa.gov>; Nunez, Carlos <Nunez.Carlos@epa.gov>; Jordan, Scott <Jordan.Scott@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>;

McKinney, Doug <Mckinney.Douglas@epa.gov>; Thoma, Eben <Thoma.Eben@epa.gov>; Yelverton, William <Yelverton.William@epa.gov>; Vette, Alan <Vette.Alan@epa.gov>; Merrill, Raymond <Merrill.Raymond@epa.gov>; Thompson, Rhonda <Thompson.Rhonda@epa.gov>; Scheffe, Rich <Scheffe.Rich@epa.gov>
Cc: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

FYI

We'll have a meeting to discuss this soon.

Kelley Spence, PhD. | Environmental Engineer | Natural Resources Group – Mail Code E143-03 | Sector Policies and Programs Division | Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency | Research Triangle Park, NC 27711 | Phone: 919-541-3158 | Fax: 919-541-3470 |

From: Dunkins, Robin
Sent: Wednesday, March 09, 2016 10:56 AM
To: Spence, Kelley <Spence.Kelley@epa.gov>; Bradfield, John <Bradfield.John@epa.gov>; Swanson, Nicholas <Swanson.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Costa, Allison <Costa.Allison@epa.gov>
Cc: Schrock, Bill <Schrock.Bill@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

FYI.

Robin Dunkins, Group Leader

Natural Resources Group

OAR/OAQPS/SPPD Mail Code: E143-03

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

919-541-5335

dunkins.robin@epa.gov

From: Koerber, Mike
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 4:44 PM
To: Dunkins, Robin <Dunkins.Robin@epa.gov>; Harnett, Bill <Harnett.Bill@epa.gov>; Schrock, Bill <Schrock.Bill@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

In case you haven't heard…..

From: Hatfield, James
Sent: Tuesday, March 08, 2016 12:51 PM
To: McCabe, Janet <McCabe.Janet@epa.gov>
Cc: Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>; Page, Steve <Page.Steve@epa.gov>; Hingeley, Maureen <Hingeley.Maureen@epa.gov>; Grzegozewski, Nicholas <Grzegozewski.Nicholas@epa.gov>; Harrison, Melissa <Harrison.Melissa@epa.gov>; Elkins, Arthur <Elkins.Arthur@epa.gov>; Sheehan, Charles <Sheehan.Charles@epa.gov>; Nunez-Mattocks, Aracely <Nunez-Mattocks.Aracely@epa.gov>; Larsen, Alan <Larsen.Alan@epa.gov>; Copper, Carolyn <Copper.Carolyn@epa.gov>; Christensen, Kevin <Christensen.Kevin@epa.gov>; Sullivan, Patrick F. <Sullivan.Patrick@epa.gov>; El-Zoghbi, Christine <El-Zoghbi.Christine@epa.gov>; Lagda, Jeffrey <Lagda.Jeffrey@epa.gov>; Hauck, Erica <Hauck.Erica@epa.gov>; Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>; Good, Kevin <Good.Kevin@epa.gov>; Woodard, Tempestt <Woodard.Tempestt@epa.gov>; Narimatsu, Julie <Narimatsu.Julie@epa.gov>; Jones, Mike <Jones.Mike@epa.gov>
Subject: OIG Project Notification: EPA's Efforts to Evaluate Air Emissions From Animal Feeding Operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018

The attached memorandum is to inform you that the EPA Office of Inspector General (OIG) plans to begin a review of EPA's efforts to

evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, Project No. OPE-FY-16-0018. This project is included in our OIG Fiscal Year 2016 Annual Plan. Our objective is to determine what actions the EPA has taken to evaluate air emissions from animal feeding operations, including the status of EPA's National Air Emissions Monitoring Study. The attached memorandum also identifies information that we are requesting be provided to us, either prior to or during our kickoff meeting.

We will contact your audit liaison in the near future to arrange a mutually agreeable time for a kickoff meeting to discuss the assignment objective and our planned work. If you or your staff have any questions, please contact me at (919) 541-1030, or Erica Hauck, Project Manager, at (303) 312-6629.

Jim

James L. Hatfield

Director, Air Product Line

USEPA Office of Inspector General

Office of Program Evaluation

109 TW Alexander Dr., N-283-01

Research Triangle Park NC 27711

919-541-1030

To: Sullivan, Tim[Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov]
Cc: Howland, Sanda[Howland.Sanda@epa.gov]
From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Fri 5/13/2016 7:01:58 PM
Subject: RE: AFO Air Emissions - OECA Follow-Up

That's very helpful, Tim. Thank you.

-Rich

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 5:16 PM
To: Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>
Cc: Howland, Sanda <Howland.Sanda@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: AFO Air Emissions - OECA Follow-Up

Rich:

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client and Deliberative

Ex. 5 - Attorney Client and Deliberative

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.

From: Jones, Richard
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 2:45 PM
To: Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>
Cc: Howland, Sanda <Howland.Sanda@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: AFO Air Emissions - OECA Follow-Up

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Rich

From: Sullivan, Tim
Sent: Thursday, May 12, 2016 1:03 PM
To: Jones, Richard <Jones.Richard@epa.gov>
Cc: Howland, Sanda <Howland.Sanda@epa.gov>
Subject: AFO Air Emissions - OECA Follow-Up

Rich:

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Please contact us should you have any questions or require any additional information about the A

greement.

Tim

Timothy J. Sullivan
Air Enforcement Division
Office of Civil Enforcement

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW (MC 2242A)
Washington, D.C. 20460

Phone: 202.564.2723 | Email: sullivan.tim@epa.gov

Help eliminate environmental violations - report tips and complaints at:
http://www.epa.gov/compliance/complaints/index.html

NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, please advise the sender immediately by reply e-mail and delete this message and any attachments from your machine and all storage media whether in electronic or hard copy. Thank you.