Message

From: Cisar, Elizabeth [Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 10/8/2021 2:00:33 PM
To: Fox, Radhika [Fox.Radhika@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Update on Filter Study

Keeping you in the loop.

Elizabeth Cisar
Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov
Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Cisar, Elizabeth
Sent: Friday, October 8, 2021 9:55 AM
To: Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>; Jennifer L. McLain (Mclain.Jennifer@epa.gov) <Mclain.Jennifer@epa.gov>; David Risley (Risley.David@epa.gov) <Risley.David@epa.gov>; Gillespie, Taylor <Gillespie.Taylor@epa.gov>; Carroll, Timothy <Carroll.Timothy@epa.gov>; Conger, Nick <Conger.Nick@epa.gov>
Cc: Tejada, Matthew <Tejada.Matthew@epa.gov>; Carrie Wehling (Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov) <Wehling.Carrie@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Update on Filter Study

Sharing this communication from the petitioners and seeking input on EPA's response to it.

Elizabeth Cisar
Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov
Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Elin Betanzo <elin@safewaterengineering.com>
Sent: Friday, October 8, 2021 9:41 AM
To: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: smorduno <smorduno@ Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) ; Nicholas.Leonard <nicholas.leonard@glelc.org>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>; banco9342 Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Subject: Re: Update on Filter Study

Hi Elizabeth,

Can you provide an update on EPA's filter messaging from your meeting late yesterday afternoon? The conflicting messages, specifically the way the press release below encourages filter use and the MDHHS press release clearly states that Benton Harbor residents should only use bottled water, are an urgent issue in Benton Harbor.

Can you please let us know which media outlets received the EPA press release you included in the email below? Luckily I haven't seen this statement picked up in any articles yet. It would be great if we can have assurance that EPA will stop pushing this message and will work with community members and petitioners to ensure that future communications are all staying on the same message and do not conflict.

I'm also unsure of the small group that was copied on this message, both on the EPA side and the petitioners side. There are more people who need to be aware that this conversation is happening.

Elin Betanzo

On Thu, Oct 7, 2021 at 10:44 AM Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Elin, Sylvia and Nick:

We are speaking with MDHHS and EGLE about their public statements about filters and the filter studies.

Nick and Sylvia, it looks like you are both available today at 3:30. Elin, will that work for you?

Elizabeth Cisar

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Sylvia Orduño <smorduno@ Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 10:04 AM
To: Elin Betanzo <elin@safewaterengineering.com>
Cc: Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Nicholas.Leonard <nicholas.leonard@glelc.org>; Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Fong, Tera <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Newton, Cheryl <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Update on Filter Study

Thank you, Elizabeth for the follow up and urgent concerns.

I completely concur with Elin. We read and heard more troubling claims from EGLE yesterday in an EJ meeting where they sought to explain and seek support for their public statements.

Based off Elizabeth's availability, I can meet today 3:30-4pm, after 6pm; tomorrow from 12-12:30pm or after 5:30pm.

We're in the middle of much response work and preparation for Saturday's community lead education & emergency petition update event in Benton Harbor.

Regards,

Sylvia

On Thu, Oct 7, 2021 at 9:38 AM Elin Betanzo <elin@safewaterengineering.com> wrote:

Thank you for including me Elizabeth,

I'd like to point out that the messaging below is inconsistent with the messaging from MDHHS yesterday. It will be unfortunate to have contradictory messages out in the community now that a real response on the ground is finally starting to assemble. Can we please have a discussion on the language and EPA's recommendation on the role of filters in the immediate response in Benton Harbor before this gets published?

Elin

On Thu, Oct 7, 2021 at 9:20 AM Cisar, Elizabeth <Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Looping in Elin Betanzo – meant to include her in the original note.

Elizabeth Cisar

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Cisar, Elizabeth
Sent: Thursday, October 7, 2021 8:54 AM
To: Nicholas.Leonard <nicholas.leonard@glelc.org>; Sylvia Orduño <smorduno@ Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Cc: Wadlington, Christina <Wadlington.Christina@epa.gov>; Tera Fong (Fong.Tera@epa.gov) <Fong.Tera@epa.gov>; Walts, Alan <walts.alan@epa.gov>; Cheryl Newton (Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov) <Newton.Cheryl@epa.gov>
Subject: Update on Filter Study

Hi Sylvia and Nick:

I wanted to let you know that because of media reports about the filter study, EPA is releasing a statement today. The statement is below. We did not expect there to be public statements to the media about the filter study yesterday and given some of the statements in the reporting, we felt an immediate response was needed. We had planned to be in contact with you about the filter study before any public communication.

I would like to update you and the rest of the petitioners about EPA's plans to conduct a filter study and to arrange a meeting with the interested petitioners, EPA's research team, and EGLE to talk about the study design and scope. Right now, I understand that you, Sylvia, Elin, Ben Pauli, and Jill Ryan would like to be part of that meeting.

I know you have a series of other items that you also want to discuss in detail. Although I don't have all the information you have requested, I'd welcome the chance to update you on what we know at this point.

I'm available today between 1-4 or after 5:30 ET. Tomorrow I could talk before 9:15, between 11-12:30 ET, or after 4:00 ET.

I look forward to speaking with you.

PUBLIC HEALTH STATEMENT

Michigan is making available and distributing free bottled water to all residents in Benton Harbor. Residents without water filters should use bottled water for cooking, drinking, brushing teeth, rinsing foods and mixing powdered infant formula. Filters have been available and the State will distribute filters and provide educational materials to show appropriate use and operation of the filters. EPA encourages Benton Harbor residents to take steps to protect themselves from lead in drinking water which may include consuming bottled water and/or using water filters.

ACCOMPANYING FILTER STATEMENT

Certified filters that are properly installed and maintained are very effective in reducing lead concentrations in drinking water, according to the most recent science and studies. In Benton Harbor, EPA urges residents to use filters as recommended and follow relevant state guidance. EPA will work with the state, as needed, to support the development of educational materials on filter use.

Out of an abundance of caution, EPA is evaluating the state of the science and taking action to confirm Benton Harbor data to further understand filter effectiveness in relation to Benton Harbor's specific

water chemistry. This study is one of the many ways that EPA is working with the community, local and state partners, to evaluate public health risks from lead exposure. The agency will continue to be involved to support and monitor the effectiveness of the immediate interventions and development of long-term solutions in Benton Harbor.

CITATIONS

1. Lead Particle Size Fractionation and Identification in Newark, New Jersey's Drinking Water Darren A. Lytle, Michael R. Schock, Casey Formal, Christina Bennett-Stamper, Stephen Harmon, Mallikarjuna N. Nadagouda, Daniel Williams, Michael K. DeSantis, Jennifer Tully, and Maily Pham Environmental Science & Technology 2020 54 (21), 13672-13679

2. POU water filters effectively reduce lead in drinking water: a demonstration field study in flint, Michigan. Bosscher V, Lytle DA, Schock MR, Porter A, Del Toral M. J Environ Sci Health A Tox Hazard Subst Environ Eng. 2019;54(5):484-493

3. Effectiveness of point-of-use and pitcher filters at removing lead phosphate nanoparticles from drinking water. Evelyne Doré, Casey Formal, Christy Muhlen, Daniel Williams, Stephen Harmon, Maily Pham, Simoni Triantafyllidou, Darren A. Lytle, Water Research, Volume 201, 2021, 117285, ISSN 0043-1354, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2021.117285.

Elizabeth Cisar (she, her)

Senior Advisor, Office of Water

US Environmental Protection Agency

Cisar.Elizabeth@epa.gov

Phone: (202)-564-4382; Cell: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

--

Elin Warn Betanzo
Safe Water Engineering, LLC

@SafeWaterEng, www.safewaterengineering.com
248-326-4339

--
Elin Warn Betanzo
Safe Water Engineering, LLC
@SafeWaterEng, www.safewaterengineering.com
248-326-4339