Message

From: LEE, LILY [LEE.LILY@EPA.GOV]
Sent: 2/8/2019 9:16:13 PM
To: Chesnutt, John [Chesnutt.John@epa.gov]; Sanchez, Yolanda [Sanchez.Yolanda@epa.gov]; Benson, Michele [Benson.Michele@epa.gov]
Subject: For your convenience I'm resending From Castleman 2/5/19 FW: Hunters Point Naval Shipyard PRGs
Attachments: L'190205 Macchiarella.ltr.pdf

From: Steven Castleman <scastleman@ggu.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, February 5, 2019 1:29 PM
To: thomas.l.macchiarella@navy.mil
Cc: Robinson, Derek J CIV NAVFAC HQ, BRAC PMO <derek.j.robinson1@navy.mil>; Norman, Marvin D CIV WEST Counsel <marvin.norman@navy.mil>; Manzanilla, Enrique <Manzanilla.Enrique@epa.gov>; Herrera, Angeles <Herrera.Angeles@epa.gov>; LEE, LILY <LEE.LILY@EPA.GOV>; Benson, Michele <Benson.Michele@epa.gov>; janet.naito@dtsc.ca.gov; Chu, Anthony@CDPH <anthony.chu@cdph.ca.gov>; MayorLondonBreed@sfgov.org; Sandra.Fewer@sfgov.org; Catherine.Stefani@sfgov.org; Aaron.Peskin@sfgov.org; Gordon.Mar@sfgov.org; vallie.brown@sfgov.org; Matt.Haney@sfgov.org; Norman.Yee@sfgov.org; mandelmanstaff@sfgov.org; RonenStaff@sfgov.org; Shamann.Walton@sfgov.org; Ahsha.Safai@sfgov.org; Brownell, Amy (DPH) <amy.brownell@sfdph.org>; bradley@greenaction.org; sheridan@greenaction.org
Subject: Hunters Point Naval Shipyard PRGs

Mr. Macchiarella,

Attached please find a letter on behalf of our client Greenaction for Health and Environmental Justice regarding the Navy's improper withholding of its Preliminary Remediation Goal (PRG) calculations - EPA's required procedure for establishing cleanup standards - during the *Parcel G Work Plan* and *Five Year Review* processes.

As the letter states, the Navy appears to have manipulated the above-referenced processes to deliberately withhold the PRG information and preclude public comment in direct violation of the provisions of CERCLA. If the Navy finalizes either the *Parcel G Work Plan* or the *Five Year Review* without providing a formal comment period for each it will be acting arbitrarily and capriciously.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Steve Castleman
Visiting Associate Professor & Staff Attorney
Environmental Law and Justice Clinic
415-442-6675 | scastleman@ggu.edu

GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW
536 Mission Street • San Francisco • CA 94105

WARNING: This E-mail, and any attachments, are covered by the Electronic Communications Privacy Act, 18 U.S.C. §2510-2521. This email may contain confidential and legally privileged information. The contents of this e-mail, and any attachments, are intended solely for the use of the person or entity to whom the e-mail was addressed. This email may also contain information that may be protected by the attorney-client privilege, work-product doctrine, or other privileges, and may be restricted from disclosure by applicable Federal and State laws. If you are not the intended recipient of this email **you are advised that any dissemination, distribution, or use of the contents of this message is strictly prohibited**. If you received this e-mail message in error, please contact the sender by reply e-mail or phone. Please also permanently delete all copies of the original e-mail and any attachments.