Message

Sent: 4/11/2019 4:40:04 PM
To: ENF-2-1 (Air/TRI enforcement); FLIR R9 Users group
CC: Mintz, Tom [Mintz.Tom@epa.gov]; Cyntia Steiner [Steiner.Cyntia@epa.gov]; Tong, Stanley [Tong.Stanley@epa.gov]; Law, Nicole [Law.Nicole@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Monthly ATW CALL - Special Edition April SKYPE Call
Attachments: UB_IRSurveyReport_Nov2018.pdf; IRsurvey_EPAwebinar_Apr2019.pptx

Fyi, courtesy of the national Air Technical Workgroup, Energy Extraction and Production Initiative, a summary of Utah State University's aerial and ground-based IR survey of wellpads in the Uinta Basin, part of today's presentation.

From: Beeler, Cindy
Sent: Wednesday, April 10, 2019 10:21 AM
To: Mia, Marcia <Mia.Marcia@epa.gov>; Amanda Brimmer <abrimmer@raqc.org>; Andrew Ahr (andrew.ahr@state.nm.us) <andrew.ahr@state.nm.us>; Adams, Sydnee <Adams.Sydnee@epa.gov>; Andrew Keyfauver <andrew.keyfauver@wyo.gov>; Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Andy Gruel - CDPHE <andrew.gruel@state.co.us>; Au, Doreen <Au.Doreen@epa.gov>; Benjamin Way <ben.way@wyo.gov>; Augustine, Bruce <augustine.bruce@epa.gov>; Bob Spillers (robert.spillers@state.nm.us) <robert.spillers@state.nm.us>; Basinger, David <Basinger.David@epa.gov>; Brandi O'Brien - WDEQ (BRANDI.OBRIEN@WYO.GOV) <BRANDI.OBRIEN@WYO.GOV>; brett.davis@wyo.gov; Bellairs, Katharina <bellairs.katharina@epa.gov>; Camas Frey (camas.frey@deq.ok.gov) <camas.frey@deq.ok.gov>; Branning, Amy <Branning.Amy@epa.gov>; Cara Keslar <cara.keslar@wyo.gov>; Breneman, Sara <breneman.sara@epa.gov>; Carissa Money (carissa.money@state.co.us) <carissa.money@state.co.us>; Buenning, Hans <Buenning.Hans@epa.gov>; Carla Mlinar <carla.mlinar@wyo.gov>; Campbell, Jean <Campbell.Jean@epa.gov>; Cember Hardison (cember.hardison@state.nm.us) <cember.hardison@state.nm.us>; Zafonte, Charles <Zafonte.Charles@epa.gov>; Chris Jensen (chrisjensen@utah.gov) <chrisjensen@utah.gov>; Cheever, Robert <cheever.robert@epa.gov>; Chris Laplante <christopher.laplante@state.co.us>; Chew, Andrew <Chew.Andrew@epa.gov>; Christopher Pennell <cpennell@utah.gov>; Daniel, Kevin <Daniel.Kevin@epa.gov>; Cindi Etcheverry <cindi.etcheverry@wyo.gov>; Dubose, Dick <DuBose.Dick@epa.gov>; Hollenberg, Cindy, NMENV <Cindy.Hollenberg@state.nm.us>; Eisele, Adam <Eisele.Adam@epa.gov>; Copeland, Cindy <ccopeland@bouldercounty.org>; Fite, Mark <Fite.Mark@epa.gov>; Craig Burger - DNR <Craig.Burger@state.co.us>; Flores, Carlos <Flores.Carlos@epa.gov>; Daniel Bon (daniel.bon@state.co.us) <daniel.bon@state.co.us>; Fried, Gregory <Fried.Gregory@epa.gov>; Danielle Nesvacil <danielle.nesvacil@tceq.texas.gov>; Glowacki, Joanna <glowacki.joanna@epa.gov>; Darla Potter (darla.potter@wyo.gov) <darla.potter@wyo.gov>; Groendyke, Todd <Groendyke.Todd@epa.gov>; Dave Aguirre <daguirre@mt.gov>; Haas, Craig <Haas.Craig@epa.gov>; Dena Wojtach <dena.wojtach@state.co.us>; Hamre, Martha <Hamre.Martha@epa.gov>; Eileen Steilman (Esteilman@mt.gov) <Esteilman@mt.gov>; Herrera, Esteban <Herrera.Esteban@epa.gov>; Fischer, Joe@ARB <jofische@arb.ca.gov>; Hoffman, Jocelyn <Hoffman.Jocelyn@epa.gov>; Franco, Guido@Energy <Guido.Franco@energy.ca.gov>; Hunt, Mary <Hunt.Mary@epa.gov>; Glenn Spangler (glenn.spangler@wyo.gov) <glenn.spangler@wyo.gov>; Iatropulos, Jamie <Iatropulos.jamie@epa.gov>; Gordon Pierce <gordon.pierce@state.co.us>; Jones, John-L <jones.john-l@epa.gov>; Grant Loney <Grant.Loney@deq.ok.gov>; Kaleri, Cynthia <kaleri.cynthia@epa.gov>; Greg Deranleau (greg.deranleau@state.co.us) <greg.deranleau@state.co.us>; Kler, Denis <Kler.Denis@epa.gov>; Greg Mayeur (gmayeur@arb.ca.gov) <gmayeur@arb.ca.gov>; Kline, James <Kline.James@epa.gov>; Greg Mortensen <gmortensen@utah.gov>; Landsman, Allison <Landsman.Allison@epa.gov>; Heather Mickelson (hmickelson@utah.gov) <hmickelson@utah.gov>; Larson, Darrin <Larson.Darrin@epa.gov>; Higgin, Roslyn, NMENV <Roslyn.Higgin@state.nm.us>; Law, Nicole <Law.Nicole@epa.gov>; Hurst, Linsey, NMENV <Linsey.Hurst@state.nm.us>; Lawrence, Kathryn <Lawrence.Kathryn@epa.gov>; Jarrett, James F <James.F.Jarrett@wv.gov>; Lischinsky, Robert <Lischinsky.Robert@epa.gov>; Jamie ODell <jamie.odell@wyo.gov>; Loiacono, Sara <loiacono.sara@epa.gov>; Jay Morris <jpmorris@utah.gov>; Loukeris, Constantinos <loukeris.constantinos@epa.gov>; Jeramy Murray <jeramy.murray@state.co.us>; Lundelius, Diana <Lundelius.Diana@epa.gov>; Jeremy Murtaugh <Jeremy.Murtaugh@state.co.us>; Magyar, Raymond <Magyar.Raymond@epa.gov>; Semerad, Jim L.

<jsemerad@nd.gov>; Makepeace, Caroline <Makepeace.Caroline@epa.gov>; Jim Nellessen (james.nellessen@state.nm.us) <james.nellessen@state.nm.us>; Malave, Maria <Malave.Maria@epa.gov>; johnrogers@utah.gov; Mastro, Donna <Mastro.Donna@epa.gov>; Kathy Primm (kathleen.primm@state.nm.us) <kathleen.primm@state.nm.us>; McFadden, Angela <McFadden.Angela@epa.gov>; Kirby Olson (kirby.olson@state.nm.us) <kirby.olson@state.nm.us>; Messina, Edward <Messina.Edward@epa.gov>; Kyrik Rombough <kyrik.rombough@state.sd.us>; Morris, Makeba <morris.makeba@epa.gov>; Lars Lone <lars.lone@wyo.gov>; Muller, Sheldon <Muller.Sheldon@epa.gov>; Leah Martland - CDPHE (leah.martland@state.co.us) <leah.martland@state.co.us>; Ostrand, Laurie <Ostrand.Laurie@epa.gov>; Lexie Wilson <lexiewilson@utah.gov>; Patefield, Scott <Patefield.Scott@epa.gov>; Louise.Esjornson@deq.ok.gov; Patel, Shilpa <patel.shilpa@epa.gov>; Lozo, Carolyn@ARB <Carolyn.Lozo@arb.ca.gov>; Wentworth, Paul <wentworth.paul@epa.gov>; Margaret Ash (margaret.ash@state.co.us) <margaret.ash@state.co.us>; Fulweiler, Pete <Fulweiler.Peter@epa.gov>; mark.mcmillan@state.co.us; Prout, Susan <prout.susan@epa.gov>; Mark Muldoon (mark.muldoon@tceq.texas.gov) <mark.muldoon@tceq.texas.gov>; Radford, Nicole <Radford.Nicole@epa.gov>; Mashburn, Joseph, NMENV <Joseph.Mashburn@state.nm.us>; Rapp, Steve <Rapp.Steve@epa.gov>; Mattox, Jennifer <jennifer.mattox@state.co.us>; Reed, Wendell <Reed.Wendell@epa.gov>; Melinda Owens (melinda.owens@state.nm.us) <melinda.owens@state.nm.us>; Rieck, Stephen <Rieck.Stephen@epa.gov>; Michael.Hopkins@epa.ohio.gov; Robledo, Tony <Robledo.Tony@epa.gov>; Miles Buckingham (miles.buckingham@wyo.gov) <miles.buckingham@wyo.gov>; Root, Kathleen <Root.Kathleen@epa.gov>; Murphy, Patrick (pmurphy@bouldercounty.org) <pmurphy@bouldercounty.org>; Rountree, Marthea <Rountree.Marthea@epa.gov>; Nancy Daher <ndaher@utah.gov>; Salazar, Matt <Salazar.Matt@epa.gov>; Neal Butt (neal.butt@state.nm.us) <neal.butt@state.nm.us>; Smith, Claudia <Smith.Claudia@epa.gov>; Nyarady, Jim@ARB <jnyarady@arb.ca.gov>; Smith, Kristi <Smith.Kristi@epa.gov>; Peterson, Mark <MPeterson2@mt.gov>; Smith, Mark A. <Smith.Marka@epa.gov>; Poley, Richard, NMENV <Richard.Poley@state.nm.us>; Sorrell, Virginia <Sorrell.Virginia@epa.gov>; Ralph Gruebel (ralph.gruebel@state.nm.us) <ralph.gruebel@state.nm.us>; Stovern, Michael <Stovern.Michael@epa.gov>; Rebecca Simpson <rebecca.simpson@state.co.us>; Sullivan, Tim <Sullivan.Tim@epa.gov>; Rhonda Romero (rhonda.romero@state.nm.us) <rhonda.romero@state.nm.us>; Suriano, Elaine <Suriano.Elaine@epa.gov>; Richardson, Thomas M. <Tom.Richardson@deq.ok.gov>; Tates, Samuel <Tates.Samuel@epa.gov>; Rusty Ruby <rruby@utah.gov>; Taylor, Kevin <Taylor.Kevin@epa.gov>; Samuel Short (samuel.short@tceq.texas.gov) <samuel.short@tceq.texas.gov>; Thompson, Steve <thompson.steve@epa.gov>; Shannon Duran (shannon.duran@state.nm.us) <shannon.duran@state.nm.us>; Tong, Stanley <Tong.Stanley@epa.gov>; Sheila Vance (svance@utah.gov) <svance@utah.gov>; Topinka, Natalie <topinka.natalie@epa.gov>; Shelby.Willeby@deq.ok.gov; Triantafillou, Kathy <triantafillou.kathy@epa.gov>; Spector - CDPHE, Stephanie <stephanie.spector@state.co.us>; Vyas, Himanshu <vyas.himanshu@epa.gov>; Stefanie.Rucker@state.co.us; Welsh, Mike <Welsh.Mike@epa.gov>; Tasha Burns (tasha.burns@state.nm.us) <tasha.burns@state.nm.us>; Werner, Leslye <Werner.Leslye@epa.gov>; Teri Waldron (teri.waldron@state.nm.us) <teri.waldron@state.nm.us>; Willard, Erin <Willard.ErinM@epa.gov>; Tickle, Greg, NMENV <Greg.Tickle@state.nm.us>; Wilwerding, Joseph <Wilwerding.Joseph@epa.gov>; Tim DeJulis (Tdejulis@utah.gov) <Tdejulis@utah.gov>; Scinta, Robert <scinta.robert@epa.gov>; timakirataylor@live.com <timothya.taylor@state.co.us>; Seth Lyman <seth.lyman@usu.edu>; Todd Wetzel (twetzel@utah.gov) <twetzel@utah.gov>; Trang Tran <trang.tran@usu.edu>; Tom Fitzgerald (tom.fitzgerald@state.nm.us) <tom.fitzgerald@state.nm.us>; Dale Wells <dale.wells@state.co.us>; Wright - CDPHE, Joseph <joseph.wright@state.co.us>
Cc: Seth Lyman (seth.lyman@usu.edu) <seth.lyman@usu.edu>; Trang Tran <trang.tran@usu.edu>
Subject: RE: Monthly ATW CALL - Special Edition April SKYPE Call

From Utah State University, Bingham Research Center, Dr. Seth Lyman and Dr. Trang Tran ...

You can download our presentation from this link: https://usu.box.com/s/wrsbw873rlievoq1du8lemghutn2z7zo. The file is large because of some embedded videos.

I have also attached the report.

Cindy Beeler
US EPA Region 8
Tel: 303-312-6204
Beeler.Cindy@epa.gov

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This e-mail, including all attachments, is for the sole use of the intended recipients and may contain Confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized use, disclosure or distribution is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of this message.

-----Original Appointment-----
From: Beeler, Cindy **On Behalf Of** Mia, Marcia
Sent: Tuesday, April 9, 2019 1:35 PM
To: Amanda Brimmer; Andrew Ahr (andrew.ahr@state.nm.us); Andrew Keyfauver; Andy Gruel - CDPHE; ben.way@wyo.gov; Bob Spillers (robert.spillers@state.nm.us); Brandi O'Brien - WDEQ (BRANDI.OBRIEN@WYO.GOV); Brett Davis (brett.davis@wyo.gov); Camas Frey (camas.frey@deq.ok.gov); Cara Keslar; Carissa Money (carissa.money@state.co.us); Carla Mlinar; Cember Hardison (cember.hardison@state.nm.us); Chris Jensen (chrisjensen@utah.gov); Chris Laplante; Christopher Pennell; Cindi Etcheverry; Cindy Hollenberg (cindy.hollenberg@state.nm.us); Copeland, Cindy; Craig Burger - DNR; Daniel Bon (daniel.bon@state.co.us); Danielle Nesvacil (danielle.nesvacil@tceq.texas.gov); Darla Potter (darla.potter@wyo.gov); Dave Aguirre; Dena Wojtach; Eileen Steilman (Esteilman@mt.gov); Fischer, Joe@ARB; Franco, Guido@Energy; Glenn Spangler (glenn.spangler@wyo.gov); Gordon Pierce; Grant Loney (Grant.Loney@deq.ok.gov); Greg Deranleau (greg.deranleau@state.co.us); Greg Mayeur (gmayeur@arb.ca.gov); Greg Mortensen <gmortensen@utah. gov>; Heather Mickelson (hmickelson@utah.gov); Higgin, Roslyn, NMENV; Hurst, Linsey, NMENV; James Jarrett (James.F.Jarrett@wv.gov); Jamie ODell; Jay Morris; Jeramy Murray (jeramy.murray@state.co.us); Jeremy Murtaugh; Jim L. Semerad; Jim Nellessen (james.nellessen@state.nm.us); johnrogers@utah.gov; Kathy Primm (kathleen.primm@state.nm.us); Kirby Olson (kirby.olson@state.nm.us); Kyrik Rombough; Lars Lone; Leah Martland - CDPHE (leah.martland@state.co.us); Lexie Wilson (lexiewilson@utah.gov); Louise.Esjornson@deq.ok.gov; Lozo, Carolyn@ARB; Margaret Ash (margaret.ash@state.co.us); MARK MCMILLAN; Mark Muldoon (mark.muldoon@tceq.texas.gov); Mashburn, Joseph, NMENV; Mattox, Jennifer; Melinda Owens (melinda.owens@state.nm.us); Michael.Hopkins@epa.ohio.gov; Miles Buckingham (miles.buckingham@wyo.gov); Murphy, Patrick (pmurphy@bouldercounty.org); Nancy Daher (NDaher@utah.gov); Neal Butt (neal.butt@state.nm.us); Nyarady, Jim@ARB; Peterson, Mark; Poley, Richard, NMENV; Ralph Gruebel (ralph.gruebel@state.nm.us); Rebecca Simpson Ph. D. (rebecca.simpson@state.co.us); Rhonda Romero (rhonda.romero@state.nm.us); Richardson, Thomas M.; Rusty Ruby; Samuel Short (samuel.short@tceq.texas.gov); Shannon Duran (shannon.duran@state.nm.us); Sheila Vance (svance@utah.gov); Shelby Willeby (Shelby.Willeby@deq.ok.gov); Spector - CDPHE, Stephanie; Stefanie.Rucker@state.co.us; Tasha Burns (tasha.burns@state.nm.us); Teri Waldron (teri.waldron@state.nm.us); Tickle, Greg, NMENV; Tim DeJulis (Tdejulis@utah.gov); Tim Taylor; Todd Wetzel (twetzel@utah.gov); Tom Fitzgerald (tom.fitzgerald@state.nm.us); Wells - CDPHE, Dale; Wright - CDPHE, Joseph
Subject: FW: Monthly ATW CALL - Special Edition April SKYPE Call
When: Wednesday, April 10, 2019 9:00 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-07:00) Mountain Time (US & Canada).
Where: 202-991-0477; 6990430#

UINTA BASIN AERIAL & GROUND-BASED IR SURVEY of WELLPADS – Dr. Seth Lyman and Dr. Trang Tran of Utah State University

Use the call-in # 202-991-0477; 6990430# to hear the presentation and ask questions. Use the "SKYPE" meeting link below to view the presentation.

This was a collaborative project between BLM, UDAQ, EPA R8, Ute Tribe and USU to conduct the helicopter IR survey of thousands of oil & gas wells in the Uinta Basin ($25k from EPA, $30k from UDAQ and $90k from BLM). Utah State University (our PM on the project) also brought money to the table to conduct ground-based IR surveys at hundreds of wellpads.

Once the project was approved through Tribal Resolution, we had a small remaining window of time to spend the money so the flyover occurred in late Feb/early March 2018.

BIG lesson learned from this work was cold ambient temperatures particularly impact the ability of OGI to detect hydrocarbon emissions against the cold background temperature of the ground.

Another lesson further supported, was that most of the emissions observed come from controlled tanks.

Observed emissions from both the aerial and ground surveys were reported to operators, some of whom then reported back on cause of leak, how/if it was repaired, and with some cost data.

Executive Summary

We used FLIR GF320 infrared optical gas imaging cameras to detect hydrocarbon emissions from oil and natural gas wells in Utah's Uinta Basin. The purposes of this study were to (1) better understand the sources of hydrocarbons from the oil and gas industry and (2) investigate different emissions detection approaches. We surveyed 3,428 oil and gas facilities (including 3,225 producing oil and gas wells) from a helicopter in February and March 2018, including well pads, compressor stations, and gas plants (though emissions were only observed from well pads). We also surveyed from the ground 419 of the same well pads that were part of the helicopter survey.

This study was funded by the Bureau of Land Management, the Utah Legislature, the Utah Division of Air Quality, and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency. A steering committee consisting of representatives from the Ute Indian Tribe, the Bureau of Land Management, the Utah Division of Air Quality, and the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency worked with our research team to plan the study and guide its execution.
The study's major conclusions include:

- Cold temperatures lead to poor contrast between emission plumes and the ground, reducing the detectable emission rate of infrared optical gas imaging cameras used from aerial platforms. The aerial portion of this study detected less than 1/10th the number of emission plumes that were observed in a similar study performed during summer months and had a detection limit that was between 2.5 and 7 times worse.

- Ground-based infrared camera surveys can detect much smaller emissions than aerial surveys. During the ground survey, we detected emissions at 31% of well pads, compared to 0.5% of pads during the aerial survey, and the detection limit for our camera, when used from the ground, was at least ten times better than when the camera was used from the helicopter. The reason for the difference was apparently largely because the camera's high sensitivity mode cannot be used effectively from the moving helicopter platform.

- Well pads with detected emissions during the ground and aerial surveys had higher oil and gas production, were younger, were more likely to be oil wells (aerial survey only), and had more liquid storage tanks per pad relative to the entire surveyed population.

- The majority of observed emission plumes were from liquid storage tanks (75.9% of all observed plumes), including emissions from pressure relief devices like pressure relief valves and thief hatches on the tank or from piping that connects to the tank.

- Well pads with control devices (combustors or vapor recovery units) to reduce emissions from tanks were more likely to have detected emissions, had more detected emissions per pad and were more likely to have emission plumes that were qualitatively categorized as large. Emissions from pads with tank controls originated mostly from tanks, including hatches, vents, and piping on tanks. This finding does not imply that the control devices themselves were not functioning properly. Instead, gas was escaping into the atmosphere before it reached a control device. Pads with control devices tended to be newer and have higher oil and gas production, which probably explains their higher rate of detected emissions.

Marcia B Mia

Air Branch
Office of Compliance
2227A WJCS
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
202-564-7042

-----Original Appointment-----
From: Mia, Marcia
Sent: Tuesday, April 9, 2019 7:52 AM
To:
Subject: Monthly ATW CALL - Special Edition April SKYPE Call
When: Wednesday, April 10, 2019 11:00 AM-12:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).
Where: 202-991-0477; 6990430#

Please use the conference line, not the computer. Thanks!

Marcia B Mia
Air Branch
Office of Compliance
2227A WJCS
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
202-564-7042

This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message without the appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, kindly advise and delete this message/attachments.

.....

Join Skype Meeting

Trouble Joining? Try Skype Web App

Help

.....