Message

From: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: 5/20/2015 1:00:36 PM
To: claudia.guerra@sfgov.org; LEE, LILY [LEE.LILY@EPA.GOV]; info@hpscac.com; amy.brownell@sfdph.org
Subject: Fwd: nbc bay area news / hunters point
Attachments: NRC Annual Inspection 2014 - No Findings or Violations.pdf; ATT00001.htm; smime.p7s; ATT00002.htm

Sent from my iPhone
Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD

Begin forwarded message:

From: Ahimsa Porter Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Date: February 15, 2015 at 12:40:20 PM PST
To: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Subject: Fwd: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Sent from Xfinity Connect Mobile App

------ Original Message ------

From: Catherine M CIV NAVFAC SW Haran
To: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai
Sent: October 16, 2014 at 10:27 AM
Subject: FW: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Dear Dr. Sumchai,

Mr. Keith Forman forwarded me your email and asked if I could follow up since he is no longer supporting the Hunters Point Naval Shipyard environmental program. Thank you for your email and concern with the Tetra Tech sampling incident at HPNS. The Navy has had similar inquiries from NBC Bay Area News and I have attached those Q&A's below to help respond to your question. In summary, the Navy is aware of the incident and has worked with the contractor to identify and correct the anomalous data. As the ultimate purpose of the Navy's environmental cleanup program is protection of human health and the environment, the Navy has developed and implemented many measures to prevent re-occurrence.

I am also attaching NRC's report on their inspection of TtEC's NRC Rad Material License at Hunters Point, which we had also discussed on the phone a few weeks back.

Please let me know if I can provide you any further information.

Very respectfully,

Catherine Haran, PE

Lead Project Manager
Hunters Point Naval Shipyard
catherine.haran@navy.mil

Q&A's submitted to NBC Bay Area News:

Question: How did the Navy determine that soil samples had been collected from locations different than the ones specified in the final status survey reports?

Navy Response: The Navy reviews field data collected by Navy contractors, including soil sample results. During a routine review of the Navy's contractor data, the Navy determined that some of the soil sample results were not consistent with the results from previous soil samples collected in the same general area. This prompted the Navy to request further evaluation by the contractor to determine the cause and extent of the data inconsistency.

Question: The report does not specify which areas and sites that were retested- areas 517, 707, 79/80 North Pier, 500, Parcel C Trenches-did in fact have radionuclides of concern at elevated levels. All of the sites? What about Building 517-Survey Unit 2 specifically? (The areas mentioned above are in Table 2 and Table 3 of the April 2014 "Investigation Conclusion Anomalous Soil Samples At Hunters Point Shipyard Revision 1" report).

Navy Response: Not all of the sites resampled were found to have radionuclides of concern above the Hunters Point Naval Shipyard (HPNS) release criteria. Specific to Building 517, Survey Unit 2, retesting found one Ra-226 sample that was above the HPNS release criteria of 1.365 pCi/g. This sample measured 1.782 pCi/g, which resulted in the remediation of one additional cubic yard of soil from the survey unit. As a comparative measure, in terms of radioactivity in food, Brazil nuts contain approximately 2 pCi/g of radium-226, according to the Nuclear Regulatory Commission.

Question: What is the Navy's response to Tetra Tech's investigation into why the soil sample discrepancy occurred?

Navy Response: The Navy determined that the contractor investigated various possible causes for the soil sample discrepancy and implemented several corrective actions to ensure the incident does not reoccur (i.e., conducting additional field oversight, conducting additional training, and supplementing their internal data review methods). The Navy continues to monitor the contractor's performance to ensure that adequate quality control and data evaluation processes are in place.

Question: Does this event call into question the quality of data provided by Tetra Tech in the past?

Navy Response: The Navy continues to evaluate all current and historic data collected by the contractor. The Navy is committed to ensuring that all reports contain accurate and defensible data.

-----Original Message-----
From: Forman, Keith S CIV NAVFACHQ, BRAC PMO
Sent: Tuesday, October 14, 2014 5:28 PM
To: Haran, Catherine M CIV NAVFAC SW
Subject: FW: nbc bay area news / hunters point

-----Original Message-----
From: Ahimsa Porter **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, September 25, 2014 11:44 AM
To: Forman, Keith S CIV NAVFACHQ, BRAC PMO
Subject: Re: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Mr. Foreman,

Great talking to you. I have fond memories of you despite the heat and rabble. I received confidential info that a Tetra Tech worker substituted clean soil for soil that actually had rad in exceedence levels. Did this incident make it to your attention?

Sent from Xfinity Connect Mobile App

------ Original Message ------

From: Keith S CIV NAVFACHQ Forman, BRAC PMO
To: Ahimsa Porter
Cc: Catherine M CIV NAVFAC SW Haran
Sent: September 23, 2014 at 4:33 PM
Subject: RE: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Dr. Sumchai,

Please tell me a phone number and a good time to call you this week. I am assuming you would like to talk to me further about this; I have copied the Lead remedial Project Manager for the Hunters Point Naval Station site, Ms. Catherine Haran.

V/r,

Keith Forman
BRAC Environmental Coordinator
Former Naval Station Treasure Island
415.308.1458

-----Original Message-----

From: Ahimsa Porter Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Thursday, September 18, 2014 3:24 PM
To: Forman, Keith S CIV NAVFACHQ, BRAC PMO
Cc: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD; Willie Ratcliff; Mary Ratcliff
Subject: Fwd: nbc bay area news / hunters point

To: Keith Forman
BRAC Environmental Coordinator
1455 Frazee Road, Suite 900
San Diego, Ca 92108-4310

Dear Mr. Forman,

I am in receipt of the January 2014 Fact Sheet Third a Five Year Review of Remedial Actions Hunters Point Naval Shipyard.

Page 4 of this document asks are the remedies working and effective?

NAVFAC provides the following answers:
Question A: Is the remedy functioning as intended by the decision documents.
Answer- Yes, for Parcels B, C, D-1, G, UC-1 and UC-2 where remedies have been undertaken.
Question B: Are the exposure assumptions, toxicity data, cleanup levels, and remedial action objectives used at the time of the remedy selection still valid?
Answer-Yes
Question C- Has any other information come to light that could call into question the protectiveness of the remedy?
Answer- No

Mr. Foreman, as a former elected representative of the HPNS Restoration Advisory Committee and founding chai of it's Radiological subcommittee I wish to formally challenge and appeal Question C. I am personally able to provide documentation that new information has come to light that calls into question the protectiveness of Radiological Operations on both Treasure Island and the Hunters Point Naval Shipyard.

Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD
Sent from Xfinity Connect Mobile App

------ Original Message ------

From: Elizabeth Wagner (NBCUniversal)
To:
Sent: September 17, 2014 at 9:43 AM
Subject: RE: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Wow.

I look forward to meeting you in person tomorrow.

From: Ahimsa Porter Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Monday, September 15, 2014 11:42 AM
To: Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)
Subject: Re: nbc bay area news / hunters point

I reviewed your reports and discovered I lived on Exposition Drive in 2001 in the TI radiologically impacted region.

Sent from Xfinity Connect Mobile App

------ Original Message ------

From: Elizabeth Wagner (NBCUniversal)
To: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD
Sent: September 15, 2014 at 10:42 AM
Subject: RE: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Ok, great. That works! See you then. My cell phone number is Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) and you can also reach me here if anything changes.

From: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Monday, September 15, 2014 10:32 AM
To: Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)
Subject: Re: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Yes. Thursday at 12 noon works. The Larkin Street Library houses the complete information repository for the shipyard administrative record on the fifth floor. We can meet at the librarian desk at noon.

Sent from my iPhone

Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD

On Sep 15, 2014, at 10:16 AM, "Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)" <Elizabeth.Wagner@nbcuni.com> wrote:

Hi Ahimsa,
Would Thursday around 12 work for you? I can meet you anywhere in San Francisco. We may hold off on the cameras for now—I'd like to meet with you first to make sure I understand the documents that you have. Does that sounds okay?

Best,

Liz

From: Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Monday, September 15, 2014 10:05 AM
To: Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)
Subject: Re: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Elizabeth,

The community room of the Waden Library is in use on Wednesday at 3pm. Can we meet in the studio?

Sent from my iPhone

Ahimsa Porter Sumchai MD

On Sep 10, 2014, at 4:45 PM, "Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)" <Elizabeth.Wagner@nbcuni.com> wrote:

Hi Ahimsa,

Thanks for getting back to me – sorry for the delay in getting back to you! Would it be possible to push the meeting back later than 1? Perhaps closer to 3p? I was hoping that we'd spend an hour just talking about your research, and then maybe conduct the interview later that afternoon? We can conduct the interview at the library if its stays open. Please let me know if that would work.

Thanks for your help!

Liz

From: Ahimsa Porter Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Tuesday, September 09, 2014 1:23 PM
To: Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)
Subject: Re: nbc bay area news / hunters point

The library opens at 1pm. Does the interview need to be done in NBC studios?

Sent from Xfinity Connect Mobile App

------ Original Message ------

From: Elizabeth Wagner (NBCUniversal)

To: asumchai@gmail.com, ahimsaportersumchaiMD@comcast.net
<mailto:ahimsaportersumchaiMD@comcast.net>
Sent: September 9, 2014 at 12:01 PM
Subject: RE: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Hi Ahimsa,

Thank you for your call today; it was nice to talk to you briefly this morning! I appreciate your perspective, and your willingness to provide historical context to the Hunters Point cleanup. I am hopeful that you might have some time next Wednesday afternoon to meet at a place that's convenient for you. Please let me know if that works!

As promised, here are links to the investigations that we have recently reported:

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations/Former-Contractors-Claim-Hunters-Point-Cleanup-is-Botched-259871511.html

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/news/local/Workers-Allege-Hunters-Point-Dirt-Needs-to-be-Screened-for-Radiation-247689791.html

Here are some others about Treasure Island:

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations/Navy-Subcontractor-Breaks-Silence-About-Radiation-Contamination-at-Treasure-Island--235499911.html

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations/Navy-Address-Residents-Concerned-About-Treasure-Island-Radiation--254625701.html

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations/Navy-Finds-Radiation-in-Treasure-Island-Home-269138341.html

http://www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations/Navy-Finds-More-Radiation-in-Treasure-Island-Homes-272073801.html

I look forward to meeting you.

Best,

Liz Wagner

--

Liz Wagner

Investigative Producer, NBC Bay Area News

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

2450 N. First Street San Jose, CA 95131

elizabeth.wagner@nbcuni.com

www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations

From: Wagner, Elizabeth (NBCUniversal)
Sent: Monday, September 08, 2014 6:11 PM
To: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Subject: nbc bay area news / hunters point

Dr. Sumchai,

Francisco Da Costa suggested that I reach out to you regarding information about the remediation of Hunters Point Naval Shipyard. I'm an investigative producer with NBC Bay Area News and I'm working on a few stories about the site cleanup. I'd love to chat with you about the tests you have performed at Hunters Point. Please call me at Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) at your earliest convenience.

Thank you,

Liz Wagner

--

Liz Wagner

Investigative Producer, NBC Bay Area News

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

2450 N. First Street San Jose, CA 95131

elizabeth.wagner@nbcuni.com

www.nbcbayarea.com/investigations