To: Alkon, Margaret[alkon.margaret@epa.gov]
From: Christenson, Kara
Sent: Wed 3/16/2016 10:42:02 PM
Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona
10-6-15 LTR to USEPA RE Hickman CAA Violations-final.pdf
SRAP_Hickman Egg Ranch.docx
70 FR 4958 Animal Feeding Operations CAFO.pdf
040136_TSD_2.0.2.0_DRAFT.pdf
040136_PERMIT_DRAFT.pdf

This email, including attachments, may contain information that is confidential and/or protected by the attorney/client or other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this email, including attachments, and notify me by email or at (415) 972-3881.

Kara Christenson

Senior Counsel

U.S. EPA Region 9

75 Hawthorne Street, 16th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105

phone: 415 972-3881 / fax: 415 947-3570

christenson.kara@epa.gov

From: Chen, Eugene
Sent: Friday, March 11, 2016 11:51 AM
To: Christenson, Kara <Christenson.Kara@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

From: Christenson, Kara
Sent: Friday, March 11, 2016 11:45 AM
To: Chen, Eugene <Chen.Eugene@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

This email, including attachments, may contain information that is confidential and/or protected by the attorney/client or other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this email, including attachments, and notify me by email or at (415) 972-3881.

Kara Christenson

Senior Counsel

U.S. EPA Region 9

75 Hawthorne Street, 16th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105

phone: 415 972-3881 / fax: 415 947-3570

christenson.kara@epa.gov

From: Chen, Eugene
Sent: Thursday, March 10, 2016 2:17 PM

To: Christenson, Kara <Christenson.Kara@epa.gov>; Rios, Gerardo <Rios.Gerardo@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Eugene

From: Christenson, Kara
Sent: Thursday, March 10, 2016 2:00 PM
To: Chen, Eugene <Chen.Eugene@epa.gov>; Rios, Gerardo <Rios.Gerardo@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

This email, including attachments, may contain information that is confidential and/or protected by the attorney/client or other privileges. If you are not an intended recipient, please delete this email, including attachments, and notify me by email or at (415) 972-3881.

Kara Christenson

Senior Counsel

U.S. EPA Region 9

75 Hawthorne Street, 16th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105

phone: 415 972-3881 / fax: 415 947-3570

christenson.kara@epa.gov

From: McKaughan, Colleen
Sent: Thursday, March 10, 2016 1:01 PM
To: Christenson, Kara <Christenson.Kara@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

FYI

From: Rios, Gerardo
Sent: Thursday, March 10, 2016 8:58 AM
To: McKaughan, Colleen <McKaughan.Colleen@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

From: Chen, Eugene
Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 2:51 PM
To: Salazar, Matt <Salazar.Matt@epa.gov>; Rios, Gerardo <Rios.Gerardo@epa.gov>
Cc: WARD, LA WEEDA <WARD.LAWEEDA@EPA.GOV>; BECKHAM, LISA <BECKHAM.LISA@EPA.GOV>; Harvey, Lornette <Harvey.Lornette@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Matt and Gerardo,

Copies of Maricopa County's non-title V permit for the Arlington facility are attached. I don't have copies of the non-title V permit for the Tonopah facility, and so don't have a complete

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Thanks,

Eugene

From: Salazar, Matt
Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 12:15 PM
To: Rios, Gerardo <Rios.Gerardo@epa.gov>
Cc: Chen, Eugene <Chen.Eugene@epa.gov>; WARD, LA WEEDA <WARD.LAWEEDA@EPA.GOV>
Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Hi Gerardo,

In the attached letter, the NGO is alleging the facilities should have had to go through the Title V permitting process. Have you looked into this at either of the facilities? Do you have copies of their permits (and if so, could I get a copy?)? I've talked with ADEQ about this a bit in terms of complaints but the permitting seems more like your teams bailiwick. Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thank you,

Matt

From: Jones, Joel E.
Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 11:58 AM
To: Salazar, Matt <Salazar.Matt@epa.gov>; Rios, Gerardo <Rios.Gerardo@epa.gov>; Berg, Elizabeth <Berg.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Lawrence, Kathryn <Lawrence.Kathryn@epa.gov>
Cc: TROMBADORE, CLAIRE <Trombadore.Claire@epa.gov>; Miller, Amy <Miller.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: FW: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

FYI

From: Miller, Amy
Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 11:54 AM
To: Blumenfeld, Jared <BLUMENFELD.JARED@EPA.GOV>; Strauss, Alexis <Strauss.Alexis@epa.gov>; Adams, Elizabeth <Adams.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Johnson, Kathleen <Johnson.Kathleen@epa.gov>; Jones, Joel E. <Jones.Joel@epa.gov>; TROMBADORE, CLAIRE <Trombadore.Claire@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Jared we are aware of this email and will be responding.

Amy C. Miller, Deputy Director

Enforcement Division

US EPA Region IX

(415) 947-4198

miller.amy@epa.gov

From: Blumenfeld, Jared
Sent: Friday, November 06, 2015 10:35 AM
To: Strauss, Alexis; Adams, Elizabeth; Miller, Amy
Subject: Fwd: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Don't Waste Arizona <dwaz@fastq.com>
Date: November 6, 2015 at 10:02:09 AM PST
To: "Blumenfeld.jared@Epa.gov" <Blumenfeld.jared@epa.gov>, <Jordan.deborah@epa.gov>, Kathleen Johnson <Johnson.kathleen@epa.gov>
Cc: <engage@az.gov>, <mc8@azdeq.gov>, <ecm@azdeq.gov>, <clerkboard@mail.maricopa.gov>, <KNOWLES.ROBERT@epa.gov>, <aginfo@azag.gov>, <LEPC@mail.maricopa.gov>, <Wendy.smith-reeve@azdema.gov>, <sgoode@mail.maricopa.gov>, <wendy.snyder@azdhs.gov>, <Chan.janice@Epa.gov>, <chadt@arlingtonk8.org>, <bobengland@mail.maricopa.gov>, <mkillian@azda.gov>, <philmcneely@mail.maricopa.gov>, <howard@shankerlaw.net>
Subject: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Via email

November 6, 2015

Jared Blumenfeld, Administrator

US EPA, Region 9

75 Hawthorne Street

San Francisco, CA 94105

Blumenfeld.jared@epa.gov

Deborah Jordan, Director

USEPA, Region 9, Air Division

Jordan.deborah@epa.gov

Kathleen Johnson, Director

USEPA, Region 9, Enforcement Division

Johnson.kathleen@epa.gov

RE: Additional air pollution concerns regarding Hickman's Egg Ranch, Inc. of Arlington, Arizona

Dear Administrator Blumenfeld:

This is a follow up to a letter submitted to USEPA Region 9, dated October 6, 2015, on behalf of the undersigned organizations regarding the Hickman's egg-laying operation in Arlington, Arizona. We have additional immediate concerns that we are requesting USEPA to address.

Many of our STOPP, Inc. - Save Tonopah Oppose Poultry Plant – and Don't Waste Arizona members attended and made comments at the Hickman's Arlington facility's minor air permit modification hearing conducted by the Maricopa County Air Quality Department (MCAQD) at Arlington Elementary School, 9410 S. 355th Avenue, Arlington, AZ on October 21, 2015. When we were leaving the school after the hearing, at about 7:30PM, the strong odor of ammonia was pervasive and almost overwhelming. (The school is less than three miles from the Hickman's Arlington facility, which is located at 32425 Salome Highway Arlington, Arizona.)

We recognize that the Hickman's Arlington facility's ammonia emissions and particulate matter that the ammonia bonds to are carried upwards during the day settle back towards ground level after nightfall. But the ammonia is being released at the Hickman's Arlington facility 24 hours a day, seven days a week. The ammonia will and does infiltrate into the school buildings, where it can become a chronic health risk, and perhaps a threat of imminent and substantial endangerment. Certainly, when children go outside of the school, and perhaps in and outside of their own homes, they are also being exposed to dangerous levels of ammonia.

The ATSDR (Agency for Toxics Substances and Disease Registry) has relevant data on its website about ammonia and ammonia's health hazards, and information about how children are at a disproportionate risk. A close review of the data shows that if a person can smell ammonia, which has an odor threshold of 5 ppm, then that person is at risk.

An MRL (Minimal Risk Level) of 1.7 ppm has been derived for acute-duration inhalation exposure (14 days or less) to ammonia. **An MRL of 0.1 ppm has been derived for chronic-duration inhalation exposure (365 days or more) to ammonia.** The ammonia odor at Arlington School that evening was very high and very irritating to human respiratory systems. ATSDR also insists that children are disproportionately affected by chemical exposures. In emergency response situations involving ammonia, 300ppm is the IDLH (Immediate Danger to Life and Health) standard, so air monitoring should be conducted especially at night to ensure this is not exceeded. With seasonal temperature inversions that trap air pollution near the ground, there could also be a dangerous condition.

The affected children attending Arlington Elementary never get away from the ammonia, and we request EPA investigation and intervention before there is a public health catastrophe. There needs to be air monitoring at and around the Arlington School, and appropriate action taken.

If Hickman's had complied with its requirements for reporting ammonia releases through EPCRA Sections 304 and 313 as we alleged, there would be publicly available data that could be used to model the area of impacts and the rate of infiltration into the Arlington Elementary School. Normally, if a facility commits an EPCRA Section 304/CERCLA 103 violation, part of the penalty determination is the adverse impact on public health, and remediation is required if public health is at risk.

We appreciate your time and consideration in this matter.

Sincerely,

Steve Brittle

Don't Waste Arizona

2934 West Northview Avenue

Phoenix, AZ 85051

smbrittle@yahoo.com

602-881-3305

Linda Butler, Chairman

STOPP, Inc. - Save Tonopah Oppose Poultry Plant

PO Box 1075

Tonopah, AZ 85354

linda.butler2014@gmail.com

805-452-5450

cc: AZ Governor Doug Ducey

AZ Attorney General Mark Brnovich

ADEQ Director Misael Cabrera, PE

AZ Department of Emergency Management Director Wendy Smith-Reeve

ATSDR Region 9 Director Capt. Robert Knowles

Maricopa County LEPC

Maricopa County Department of Emergency Management

Janice Chan, USEPA, Region 9, Enforcement Division of Air & TRI Section

Eric Massey, Director, Air Quality Division of Arizona Department of Environmental Quality

Dr. Bob England, Director Maricopa County Department of Public Health

Howard M. Shanker, Attorney The Shanker Law Firm, PLC

Chad Turner, Superintendent, Arlington Elementary School District

Steven Goode, Director, Maricopa County Department of Environmental Services

Misael Cabera, Director, Arizona Department of Environmental Quality

Mark W. Killian, Director, Department of Agriculture

Cara M. Christ, MD, Director, Arizona Department of Public Health

Phillip McNeely, Director, Maricopa County Air Quality Department

Maricopa County Board of Supervisors

Denny Barney, District 1 Supervisor

Steve Chucri, District 2 Supervisor and Chairman

Andy Kunasek, District 3 Supervisor

Clint L. Hickman, District 4 Supervisor

Steve Gallardo, District 5 Supervisor