LAW OFFICES
BRODSKY & SMITH, LLC

9595 WILSHIRE BLVD., SUITE 900
BEVERLY HILLS, CA 90212

877.534.2590
FAX 310.247.0160
www.brodskysmith.com

NEW JERSEY OFFICE
1040 KINGS HIGHWAY NORTH, STE 650
CHERRY HILL, NJ 08034.
856.795.7250

NEW YORK OFFICE
240 MINEOLA BOULEVARD
MINEOLA, NY 11501
516.741.4977

PENNSYLVANIA OFFICE
TWO BALA PLAZA, STE 510
BALA CYNWYD, PA 19004
610.667.6200

JUL 14 2017

July 7, 2017

President/CEO Ariza Cheese Co., Inc. 7602 Jackson St. Paramount, CA 90723	Ariza Cheese Co., Inc. c/o Carolina Marin-Henriquez, Agent for Service of Process 3780 Kilroy Airport Way, Suite 200 PMB 401 Long Beach, CA 90806
Administrator U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Mail Code: 1101A 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20460	Executive Officer Regional Water Quality Control Board Los Angeles Region 320 West Fourth Street, Suite 200 Los Angeles, CA 90013
Regional Administrator U.S. EPA, Region 9 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105	Executive Director State Water Resources Control Board 1001 I Street Sacramento, CA 95814

Re: Notice of Violation and Intent to File Suit under the Clean Water Act

To Whom It May Concern:

Brodsky & Smith, LLC ("Brodsky Smith") represents Personal Privacy 6 a citizen of the State of California. This letter is to give notice that Brodsky Smith, on Personal Privacy 6 behalf, intends to file a civil action against Ariza Cheese Co., Inc. ("Ariza Cheese") for violations of the Federal Water Pollution Control Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1251 *et seq.* ("Clean Water Act" or "CWA") at Ariza Cheese's facility located 7602 Jackson St., Paramount, CA 90723 (the "Facility").

Personal Priv is a citizen of the State of California who is concerned with the environmental health of the Los Angeles River, uses and enjoys the waters of the Los Angeles River, its inflows, and other areas of the overall Los Angeles River Watershed, of which the Los Angeles River is a part. Personal Privacy use and enjoyment of these waters are negatively affected by the pollution caused by Ariza Cheese's operations. Additionally, Personal Priv acts in the interest of the general public to prevent pollution in these waterways, for the benefit of their ecosystems, and for the benefits of all individuals and communities who use these waterways for various recreational, educational, and spiritual purposes.

This letter addresses Ariza Cheese's unlawful operation of a "Light Industry" facility[1] without proper coverage under General Permit No CAS000001 [State Water Resources Control Board] Water Quality

[1] "Light Industry" facilities are included in the category of "Manufacturing Facilities" defined in the Industrial Stormwater Permit as "Facilities with Standard Industrial Classifications (SICs) 20XX through 39XX, 5221 through 4225." *See*, Industrial Stormwater Permit, Attachment A, Category 2.

Order No. 2014-0057-DWQ (the "Industrial Stormwater Permit").[2] Furthermore, by operating in violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Ariza Cheese's Facility discharges stormwater, which likely contains pollutants from the Facility's industrial activities, via indirect flow into the Los Angeles River and the overall Los Angeles River Watershed. Specifically, investigation of the Facility has uncovered significant, ongoing, and continuous violations of the CWA and the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System ("NPDES") General Permit No CAS000001 [State Water Resources Control Board] Water Quality Orders No. 2014-0057-DWQ (the "Industrial Stormwater Permit").[3]

CWA section 505(b) requires that sixty (60) days prior to the initiation of a civil action under CWA section 505(a), a citizen must give notice of his or her intent to file suit. 33 U.S.C. § 1365(b). Notice must be given to the alleged violator, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), and the State in which the violations occur. As required by section 505(b), this Notice of Violation and Intent to File Suit provides notice to Ariza Cheese of the violations that have occurred and which continue to occur at the Facility. After the expiration of sixty (60) days from the date of this Notice of Violation and the Intent to File Suit, Personal Priva intends to file suit in federal court against Ariza Cheese under CWA section 505(a) for the violations described more fully below.

During the 60-day notice period, Personal Priv is willing to discuss effective remedies for the violations noticed in this letter. We suggest that Ariza Cheese contact Personal Privacy attorneys at Brodsky & Smith within the next twenty (20) days so that these discussions may be completed by the conclusion of the 60-day notice period. Please note that we do not intend to delay the filing of a complaint in federal court, and service of the complaint shortly thereafter, even if discussions are continuing when the notice period ends.

I. THE LOCATION OF THE ALLEGED VIOLATIONS

A. The Facility

Ariza Cheese's Facility is located at 7602 Jackson St., Paramount, CA 90723. At the Facility, Ariza Cheese operates as a manufacturer of various different cheeses as well as a distributer for restaurants, delis, cheese shops, and markets nationwide. The Facility's industrial activities fall under Standard Industrial Classification ("SIC") Code 2022, relating to the manufacturing of natural, processed, and imitation cheese, placing it in Category 2, Manufacturing Facilities, required to obtain coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *See*, Industrial Stormwater Permit, Attachment A, Category 2. In addition, the aforementioned industrial processes occurring relates to the manufacturing of natural, processed, and imitation cheese. Other activities likely carried out in the regular course of business at the facility include storage of fuel and other oils, maintenance, equipment storage, and waste storage. Repair and maintenance activities carried out at the facility include, but are not limited to, electrical, plumbing, roofing, asphalt, concrete, and utilities repairs as well as janitorial duties. Possible pollutants from the Facility include pH, Oil & Grease ("O & G"), total suspended solids ("TSS"), waste oils, lubricants, fuel, trash, debris, hazardous materials, heavy metals, and other pollutants. Stormwater from the Facility discharges, indirectly, into the Los Angeles River.

---

[2] While "Light Industry" facilities where industrial materials, equipment, or activates were not exposed to stormwater were not required to have coverage prior to July 1, 2015, under Permit No CAS000001 [State Water Resources Control Board] Water Quality Order 92-12-DWQ (as amended by Order No. 97-03-DWQ) (the "Previous Industrial Stormwater Permit"), the requirements of the Industrial Stormwater Permit as effective on July 1, 2015 now require all such facilities to obtain coverage.

[3] On April 1, 2014, the State Water Resources Control Board adopted an updated NPDES General Permit for Discharges Associated with Industrial Activity, Water Quality Order No. 2014-57-DWQ, which has taken force or effect on its effective date of July 1, 2015. As of the effective date, Water Quality Order No. 2014-57-DWQ has superseded and rescinded the Previous Industrial Stormwater Permit except for purposes of enforcement actions brought pursuant to the prior permit.

B. The Affected Water

The Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed are waters of the United States. The CWA requires that water bodies such as the Los Angeles River and overall the Los Angeles River Watershed meet water quality objectives that protect specific "beneficial uses." The beneficial uses of the Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed include commercial and sport fishing, estuarine habitat, fish migration, navigation, preservation of rare and endangered species, water contact and non-contact recreation, shellfish harvesting, fish spawning, and wildlife habitat. Contaminated stormwater from the Facility adversely affects the water quality of the Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed, and threatens the beneficial uses and ecosystem of these watersheds, which includes habitats for threatened and endangered species.

II. THE FACILITY'S VIOLATIONS OF THE CLEAN WATER ACT

It is unlawful to discharge pollutants to waters of the United States, such as the Los Angeles River, without an NPDES permit or in violation of the terms and conditions of an NPDES permit. CWA § 301(a), 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a); *see also* CWA § 402(p), 33 U.S.C. § 1342(p) (requiring NPDES permit issuance for the discharge of stormwater associated with industrial activities). The Industrial Stormwater Permit authorizes certain discharges of stormwater, conditioned on compliance with its terms.

Information available to Personal Priva indicates that Ariza Cheese has not obtained coverage for stormwater discharge from the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, and therefore, stormwater discharges from the Facility have violated several terms of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA. Apart from discharges that comply with the Industrial Stormwater Permit, the Facility is in violation of the CWA every time it discharges stormwater into waters of the United States.

A. Discharges in Excess of BAT/BCT Levels

The Effluent Limitations of the Industrial Stormwater Permit prohibit the discharge of pollutants from the Facility in concentrations above the level commensurate with the application of best available technology economically achievable ("BAT") for toxic pollutants[4] and best conventional pollutant control technology ("BCT") for conventional pollutants.[5] Industrial Stormwater Permit § I(D)(32), II(D)(2). The EPA has published Benchmark values set at the maximum pollutant concentration present if an industrial facility is employing BAT and BCT, as listed in Attachment 1 to this letter.[6] These benchmark values are reiterated and incorporated into the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2.

In addition, the Industrial Stormwater Permit requires dischargers to comply with Effluent Limitations "consistent with U.S. EPA's 2008 Multi Sector General Permit for Stormwater Discharges Associated with Industrial Activity (the "2008 MSGP")". *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § I(D)(33). The 2008 MSGP has specific numeric effluent limitations based upon Standard Industrial Classification ("SIC") codes. Furthermore, these SIC code based benchmark values are reiterated and incorporated into the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2. Notably, Ariza Cheese is classified as falling under several SIC Code 2022 categories, relating to the manufacturing of natural,

---

[4] BAT is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 437.1 *et seq.* Toxic pollutants are listed at 40 C.F.R. § 401.15 and include copper, lead, and zinc, among others.

[5] BCT is defined at 40 C.F.R. § 437.1 *et seq.* Conventional pollutants are listed at 40 C.F.R. § 401.16 and include BOD, TSS, oil and grease, pH, and fecal coliform.

[6] The Benchmark values are part of the EPA's Multi-Sector General Permit ("MSGP") and can be found at: http://www.epa.gov/npdes/pubs/msgp2008_finalpermit.pdf. *See* 73 Fed. Reg. 56, 572 (Sept. 29, 2008) (Final National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) General Permit for Stormwater Discharges From Industrial Activities).

processed, and imitation cheese, requiring it to be within numerical effluent limitations for (i) pH; (ii) Oil and Grease; and (iii) Total Suspended Solids. Based on the Facility's lack of coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Ariza Cheese has not met this requirement and has been in violation of the Industrial Period since July 1, 2015.

The Facility's lack of coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit has resulted in Ariza Cheese's failure to adequately monitor numerical pollutant discharge values for every instance of stormwater discharge since July 1, 2015. This lack of coverage and subsequent inadequate self-monitoring indicate that Ariza Cheese has failed and is failing to employ measures that constitute BAT and BCT in violation of the requirements of the Industrial Stormwater Permit.

Ariza Cheese's ongoing discharges of stormwater from the Facility without proper coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit and subsequent lack of monitoring of pollutant discharge values have likely led to Ariza Cheese discharging stormwater containing levels of pollutants above EPA Benchmark values and BAT and BCT based levels of control, and further demonstrate that Ariza Cheese has not developed and implemented sufficient Best Management Practices ("BMPs") at the Facility. Proper BMPs could include, but are not limited to, moving certain pollution-generating activities under cover or indoors capturing and effectively filtering or otherwise treating all stormwater prior to discharge, frequent sweeping to reduce build-up of pollutants on-site, installing filters on downspouts and storm drains, and other similar measures.

Ariza Cheese's failure to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, and develop and/or implement adequate pollution controls to meet BAT and BCT at the Facility violates, and will continue to violate, the CWA and the Industrial Stormwater Permit each and every day Ariza Cheese's discharges stormwater without meeting BAT/BCT. Personal Priv alleges that Ariza Cheese has discharged stormwater containing excessive levels of pollutants from the Facility to the Los Angeles River during at least every significant local rain event over 0.2 inches since July 1, 2015.[7] Attachment 3 compiles all dates since July 1, 2015 when a significant rain event occurred. Ariza Cheese is subject to civil penalties for each violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA since July 1, 2015.

B. Discharges Impairing Receiving Waters

The Industrial Stormwater Permit's Discharge Prohibitions disallow stormwater discharges that cause or threaten to cause pollution, contamination, or nuisance. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § III. The Industrial Stormwater Permit also prohibits stormwater discharges to surface or groundwater that adversely impact human health or the environment. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § VI(b)-(c). Receiving Water Limitations of the Industrial Stormwater Permit prohibit stormwater discharges that cause or contribute to an exceedance of applicable Water Quality Standards ("WQS") contained in a Statewide Water Quality Control Plan or the applicable Regional Water Board's Basin Plan. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § VI(a). Applicable WQS are set forth in the California Toxic Rule ("CTR")[8] and Chapter 3 of the Los Angeles Region (Region 4) Water Quality Control Plan (the "Basin Plan").[9] *See* Attachment 1. Exceedances of WQS are violations of the Industrial Stormwater Permit, the CTR, and the Basin Plan.

The Basin Plan establishes WQS for all Inland Surface and Coastal waters of Los Angeles and Ventura Counties, including but not limited to the following:

---

[7] Significant local rain events are reflected in the rain gauge data available at: http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/cdo-web/search.

[8] The CTR is set forth at 40 C.F.R. § 131.38 and is explained in the Federal Register preamble accompanying the CTR promulgation set forth at 65 Fed. Reg. 31, 682 (May 18, 2000).

[9] The Basin Plan is published by the Los Angeles Regional Water Quality Control Board at: http://www.waterboards.ca.gov/losangeles/water_issues/programs/basin_plan/basin_plan_documentation.shtml.

- Waters shall not contain suspended or settleable material in concentrations that cause nuisance or adversely affect beneficial users.

- Waters shall be free of changes in turbidity that cause nuisance or adversely affect beneficial uses. Increases in natural turbidity attributable to controllable water quality factors shall not exceed 20% where natural turbidity is between 0 and 50 nephelometric turbidity units ("NTU"), and shall not exceed 10% where the natural turbidity is greater than 50 NTU.

- All waters shall be maintained free of toxic substances in concentrations that are toxic to, or that produce detrimental physiological responses in, human, plant, animal, or aquatic life.

- Surface waters shall not contain concentrations of chemical constituents in amounts that adversely affect any designated beneficial use.

Personal Priv alleges that Ariza Cheese's stormwater discharges have caused or contributed to exceedances of Receiving Water Limitations in the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the WQS set forth in the Basin Plan and CTR. These allegations are based on the Facility's lack of coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit and discharges of stormwater during such period. These un-covered stormwater discharges indicate that Ariza Cheese's discharges are causing or threatening to cause pollution, contamination, and/or nuisance; adversely impacting human health or the environment; and violating applicable WQS.

Personal Priv alleges that each day that Ariza Cheese has discharged stormwater from the Facility without appropriate coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit Ariza Cheese's stormwater has and/or may have contained levels of pollutants that exceeded one or more of the Receiving Water Limitations and/or applicable WQS in the Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed. Personal Priva alleges that Ariza Cheese has discharged stormwater exceeding Receiving Water Limitations and/or WQS from the Facility to the Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed during at least every significant local rain event over 0.2 inches since July 1, 2015. *See* Attachment 3. Each discharge from the Facility that violates a Receiving Water Limitation or has caused or contributed, or caused or contributes, to an exceedance of an applicable WQS constitutes a separate violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA Ariza Cheese is subject to penalties for each violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA since July 1, 2015.

C. Failure to Develop and Implement an Adequate Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan

The Industrial Stormwater Permit requires dischargers to develop and implement an adequate Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan ("SWPPP"). *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit, § X(B). The Industrial Stormwater Permit also requires dischargers to make all necessary revisions to existing SWPPPs promptly. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit, § X(B.

The SWPPP must include, among other requirements, the following: a site map, a list of significant materials handled and stored at the site, a description and assessment of all Ariza Cheese pollutant sources, a description of the BMPs that will reduce or prevent pollutants in stormwater discharges, specification of BMPs designed to reduce pollutant discharge to BAT and BCT levels, a comprehensive site compliance evaluation completed each reporting year, and revisions to the SWPPP within 90 days after a facility manager determines that the SWPPP is in violation of any requirements of the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit, § X(A).

As Ariza Cheese has failed to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Personal Priv alleges and informs Ariza Cheese that it has failed to prepare and/or implement an adequate SWPPP and has therefore failed to satisfy each of the requirements of § X(A) of the Industrial Stormwater Permit.

Accordingly, Ariza Cheese has violated the CWA each and every day that it has failed to develop and/or implement an adequate SWPPP meeting all of the requirements of § X(A) of the Industrial Stormwater

Permit, and Ariza Cheese will continue to be in violation every day until it obtains coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit and develops and implements an adequate SWPPP. Ariza Cheese is subject to penalties for each violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA occurring since July 1, 2015.

D. Failure to Develop and Implement an Adequate Monitoring and Reporting Program and to Perform Annual Comprehensive Site Compliance Evaluations

The Industrial Stormwater Permit requires facility operators to develop and implement a Monitoring and Reporting Program ("MRP"). *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit, § XI. The Industrial Stormwater Permit requires that MRP ensure that each the facility's stormwater discharges comply with the Discharge Prohibitions, Effluent Limitations, and Receiving Water Limitations specified in the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *Id.* Facility operators must ensure that their MRP practices reduce or prevent pollutants in stormwater and authorized non-stormwater discharges as well as evaluate and revise their practices to meet changing conditions at the facility. *Id.* This may include revising the SWPPP as required by § X(A) of the Industrial Stormwater Permit.

The MRP must measure the effectiveness of BMPs used to prevent or reduce pollutants in stormwater and authorized non-stormwater discharges, and facility operators must revise the MRP whenever appropriate. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit, § XI. The Industrial Stormwater Permit requires facility operators to visually observe and collect samples of stormwater discharges from all drainage areas. *Id.* Facility operators are also required to provide an explanation of monitoring methods describing how the facility's monitoring program will satisfy these objectives. *Id.*

As Ariza Cheese has failed to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Ariza Cheese has been operating the Facility with an inadequately developed and/or inadequately implemented MRP, in violation of the substantive and procedural requirements set forth in Section B of the Industrial Stormwater permit.

Additionally, the Industrial Stormwater Permit requires dischargers to comply with Effluent Limitations "consistent with U.S. EPA's 2008 Multi Sector General Permit for Stormwater Discharges Associated with Industrial Activity (the "2008 MSGP")". The 2008 MSGP has specific numeric effluent limitations based upon Standard Industrial Classification ("SIC") codes. Furthermore, these SIC code based benchmark values are reiterated and incorporated into the Industrial Stormwater Permit. *See* Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2. Notably, Ariza Cheese is classified as falling under SIC Code 2022, relating to the manufacturing of natural, processed, and imitation cheese, requiring it to be within numerical effluent limitations for (i) pH; (ii) Oil and Grease; and (iii) Total Suspended Solids. As previously stated, and in clear violation of the terms of the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Ariza Cheese has consistently failed to adequately monitor its stormwater discharges since July 1, 2015 due the Facility's lack of coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit. Therefore, Ariza Cheese has not effectively identified or responded to compliance problems at the Facility or resulted in effective revision of any such BMPs in use to address such ongoing problems as required by Industrial Stormwater Permit, § XI.

As a part of the MRP, the Industrial Stormwater Permit specifies that Facility operators shall collect a total of four (4) stormwater samples throughout an annual reporting period. Specifically the Industrial Stormwater Permit requires, "The discharger to collect and analyze samples from two (2) Qualifying Storm Events ('QSE's) within the first half of each reporting year (July 1 to December 31), and two (2) QSEs within the second half of each reporting year (January 1 to June 30)." Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI B(2). Furthermore, should facility operators fail to collect samples from the first storm event of the wet season, they are still required to collect samples from two other storm events during the wet season, and explain in the annual report why the first storm event was not sampled. *Id.* Due to Ariza Cheese's failure to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit, Ariza Cheese has not conducted any stormwater sampling whatsoever since July 1, 2015.

As a result of Ariza Cheese's failure to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit and its subsequent failure to adequately develop and/or implement an adequate MRP at

the Facility, Ariza Cheese has been in daily and continuous violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA each and every day since July 1, 2015. These violations are ongoing. Ariza Cheese will continue to be in violation of the monitoring and reporting requirement each day that Ariza Cheese fails to obtain coverage under the Industrial Stormwater Permit and fails to adequately develop and/or implement an effective MRP at the Facility. Ariza Cheese is subject to penalties for each violation of the Industrial Stormwater Permit and the CWA occurring since July 1, 2015.

E. Unpermitted Discharges

Section 301(a) of the CWA prohibits the discharge of any pollutant into waters of the United States unless the discharge is authorized by a NPDES Permit issued pursuant to Section 402 of the CWA. *See* 33 U.S.C. §§ 1311(a), 1342.

Notably, Ariza Cheese has failed to obtain coverage for the Facility under the Industrial Stormwater Permit. Any discharge from an industrial facility not in compliance with the Industrial Stormwater Permit "must be either eliminated or permitted by a separate NPDES permit." Industrial Stormwater Permit, § III. Notably, as Ariza Cheese has not obtained coverage under either the Industrial Stormwater Permit or a separate NPDES, each and every discharge from the Facility described herein is in compliance with the Industrial Stormwater Permit has constituted and will continue to constitute a discharge without CWA Permit coverage in violation of section 301(a) of the CWA, 33 U.S.C. § 1311(a).

Notably, Plaintiff informs Ariza Cheese that stormwater discharges from the Facility to the Los Angeles River and overall Los Angeles River Watershed are likely to have occurred during at least every significant local rain event over 0.2 inches since July 1, 2015, at the locations described below in Attachment 2. *See* Attachments 2, 3.

IV. PERSON RESPONSIBLE FOR THE VIOLATIONS

Ariza Cheese Co., Inc. is the person responsible of the violations at the Facility described above.

V. NAME AND ADDRESS OF NOTICING PARTY

Personal Privacy 6
[redacted]
Long Beach, CA 90805
Personal Privacy 6

VI. COUNSEL

Evan J. Smith, Esquire
esmith@brodskysmith.com
Ryan P. Cardona, Esquire
rcardona@brodskysmith.com
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 900
Beverly Hills, CA 90212
T: (877) 534-2590
F: (310) 247-0160

VII. REMEDIES

Personal Priv intends, at the close of the 60-day notice period or thereafter, to file a citizen suit under CWA section 505(a) against Ariza Cheese for the above-referenced violations Personal Privac will seek declaratory and injunctive relief to prevent further CWA violations pursuant to CWA sections 505(a) and (d), 33 U.S.C. § 1365(a) and (d), and such other relief as permitted by law. In addition, Personal Priva will seek civil penalties pursuant to CWA section 309(d), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(d), and 40 C.F.R. § 19.4, against Ariza Cheese in this action. The

CWA imposes civil penalty liability of up to $37,500 per day per violation for violations occurring after January 12, 2009. 33 U.S.C. § 1319(d); 40 C.F.R. § 19.4. Personal Privac will seek to recover attorneys' fees, experts' fees, and costs in accordance with CWA section 505(d), 33 U.S.C. § 1365(d).

As noted above, Personal Priva and his Counsel are willing to meet with you during the 60-day notice period to discuss effective remedies for the violations noted in this letter. Please contact me to initiate these discussions.

Sincerely,

Evan J. Smith, Esquire
esmith@brodskysmith.com
Ryan P. Cardona, Esq.
rcardona@brodskysmith.com
Brodsky & Smith, LLC
9595 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 900
Beverly Hills, CA
T: (877) 534-2590
F: (310) 247-0160

ATTACHMENT 1

EPA BENCHMARKS AND WATER QUALITY STANDARDS FOR DISCHARGES TO FRESHWATER

A. EPA Benchmarks, 2008 Multi-Sector General Permit ("MSGP"); Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B), Tables 1-2

Parameter	Units	Benchmark Value	Source
pH	pH Units	Less than 6.0 Greater than 9.0 (Instantaneous)	2008 MSGP; Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2
Oil & Grease	Mg/L	25 (Instantaneous) 15 (Annual)	2008 MSGP; Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2
Total Suspended Solids	Mg/L	400 (Instantaneous) 100 (Annual)	2008 MSGP; Industrial Stormwater Permit § XI(B) Tables 1-2

B. Water Quality Standards – Discharge Limitations and Monitoring Requirements (40 CFR Part 131.38 (California Toxics Rule or CTR), May 18, 2000)

Parameter	Units	Water Quality Objectives		Source
		4- Day Average	1-Hr Average	
Lead	Mg/L	0.0081	0.21	**40 CFR Part 131.38**
Zinc	Mg/L	0.081	0.090	**40 CFR Part 131.38**

ATTACHMENT 2

LIKELY LOCATIONS AND CONTRIBUTING FACTORS OF UNPERMITTED POLLUTANT AND STORMWATER DISCHARGE FROM ARIZA CHEESE'S FACILITY

The following table contains descriptions of the likely locations and contributing factors of unpermitted pollutant and stormwater discharge from Ariza Cheese's Facility.

Location	Description
Discharge Point: Drains on Minnesota Ave.	Three submerged pipes come from the West side of the property and discharge on Minnesota Ave. where rainwater and materials channel through an industrial ditch, through the pipes, and onto the curb then to an inlet located down the street.
Drainage Point: Ditch through Lot	The driveway and most of the parking lot facing Minnesota Ave. are sloped downwards heading towards an industrial concrete ditch where all materials and substances pooled on the concrete from the lot combine with rainfall or another water source and to the drain system.
Exposed Refuse and Equipment	Machinery, dumpsters, skids, trucks, and other equipment observed on the lot are left partially uncovered and exposed to rainfall which sends the collected residue off of the equipment and into the ditch and onto Minnesota Ave.
Downspouts	The downspouts located along the building send rainwater from the spouts to the front of the property facing East which channels directly onto Minnesota Ave.
Parking Lot Surface Imperfections	The observed cracks and bumps on the concrete of the parking lot collect materials and substances which, with rainfall, pool and integrate and eventually flow to the inlets down the street.

ATTACHMENT 3:
ALLEGED DATES OF QUALIFYING STORM EVENTS AT ARIZA CHEESE'S FACILITY
July 1, 2015 – June 25, 2017

Days with precipitation two-tenths of an inch or greater, as reported by NOAA's National Climatic Data Center, Station: Long Beach Daugherty Airport, CA US GHCND:USW00023129, when a stormwater discharge from the Facility is likely to have occurred. *See*, http://www.ncdc.noaa.gov/cdo-web/search.

2015	2016	2017
7/18	1/5	1/5
9/15	1/6	1/9
12/22	1/7	1/11
	1/31	1/12
	2/17	1/19
	3/6	1/20
	3/11	1/22
	10/17	2/3
	11/20	2/10
	11/21	2/17
	11/26	5/7
	12/15	
	12/16	
	12/21	
	12/22	
	12/23	
	12/30	