From:	Harry Roels
To:	Colledge, Michelle; Julian, Jaime; Vihra Gocheva; Cheryl.beseler@colostate.edu; Lobdell, Danelle; Rosemarie Bowler
Cc:	Bollweg, George
Subject:	Teleconference 24 Sept. 2013
Date:	Tuesday, October 01, 2013 4:06:08 AM
Attachments:	Revision of 8-31-13 of JESEE submitted Mn Exposure Manuscript incl all ATSDR and Peer review comments 8-26-13.docx

---

Dear Colleagues,

The telephone conference of Sept. 24, 2013, ended unfortunately in an obsolete discussion about events which happened at the end of August 2013 following careless uploading of Michelle's air-Mn MS for which she apparently cannot be held accountable. In fact on 8-26-2013 an incorrect earlier version of the manuscript had been submitted to JESEE. After having cross-checked and revised this version on 8-31-2013, I was greatly disappointed about the sloppy uploading work and decided to act immediately as a concerned co-author of the MS. I brought this mistake to the attention of Michelle as early as Aug. 27, hence I feel it unfair to blame me that I should not have recognized the first author in this matter. Moreover, as none of the other co-authors spotted the uploading mistake, I may say that the group benefited *a posteriori* from my prompt intervention. In my opinion, once a MS is submitted for peer-review it is going public and thus susceptible to enhance or jeopardize an author's reputation as to his peers. Therefore, it was very frustrating to experience the deplorable negligence of the group with regard to the responsibility each co-author of the paper bears as to the form and scientific content of the MS.

The chain of events prompted me to an expeditious intervention with respect to the JESEE peer-review process, which I formulated in my email of Aug. 31 as follows: "*As I suspected, the actual manuscript version that has been submitted on Aug. 26, 2013, is nearly similar to an earlier version I received on April 15, 2013 (20:42), from M. Colledge for comments. The April 15 manuscript version needed substantial changes according to my review and therefore as a co-author I could not grant clearance for submission. On April 16, 2013 (23:12), M. Colledge sent to each co-author a revised version called "Final Mn manuscript" addressing my comments and which I could agree upon pending a few minor points (sent to M. Colledge on April 21, 2013, 12:55 AM) that she promised to address before submitting to JESEE. I my opinion the "Final Mn manuscript" version of April 16 is a better candidate version and should have been submitted".* The wrongly submitted 4-15-13 version differed appreciably from the 4-16-13 version I agreed on as you can see in the revision (see attachment) I made to bring the wrong version in line with the 4-16-13 version I approved.

It was very unpleasant to experience at the end of the teleconference that hardly attention was given to my arguments and that it was not understood that I acted to protect the group from nasty collateral damage that may occur when the submission of a MS is carried out without the required care and responsibility. This is the lesson I learned from the 10-yr experience as Assistant Editor of OEM (Occupational and Enviromental Medicine). For instance, a sloppy handling of the Editor as to a conflict with the authors, put recently Tomas Guilarte in deep embarrassment as the same MS has been published by two journals!

Considering what I mentioned before and the emotional and physical disconfort I experienced after the teleconference prompted me to decide, after the dust settled down, to stop my participation in the further activities of the group. I do not retract my name from Michelle's

paper for which I will take care until its publication in a scientific journal. Hopefully, the group will do well without my support.

Best regards,

Harry Roels

****

--
Prof. em. Harry A. Roels
J. Pauwelslaan 3
3271 Averbode
Belgium

Tel: +32-13-556955
Mobile: +32-476872004
E-mail: roelsharry@telenet.be